

Free Thought/Pensamiento Libre



Journal of the History and Philosophy Honor Society
Issue 2, 2017

Cover: Puhong Li, Red Eyes, 2016

Herodotus's Horse-organization's symbol- by Professor Marianne Santelli from ESL, World Language and Culture Department at Middlesex County College.

Free Thought/ Pensamiento Libre is printed at Middlesex County College Printing and Communication Services

ISSN: 2472-6486

History and Philosophy Honor Society
History and Social Science Department
Middlesex County College
2600 Woodbridge Ave,
Edison, New Jersey. 08818

Free Thought/Pensamiento Libre



Journal of the History and Philosophy
Honor Society at Middlesex County College

Issue 2, 2017

© 2017 Copyrights over work- either text or artwork- published in the journal are retained by their author (s).

© 2017 Copyrights over journal layout and symbol- Herodotus' Horse- are retained by the History and Philosophy Honor Society. History and Philosophy Honor Society reserves the rights to make unlimited copies of the Journal and its unrestricted distribution in any format

Acknowledgments

This publication could not have been possible without the active support of President Joann La Perla-Morales, Mark McCormick, Vice President for Academic and Students Affairs, Patrick Madama, Vice President for Institutional Advancement, Thomas Peterson, Director of Marketing Communications, Robin Hetzko, manager at Printing and Communication Services, Odé Hoppie, Assistant Director of Student Activities, Timothy Hack, Chair at History and Social Science Department, Professor Susan Altman from Visual and Performing Arts Department and Natali Justiniano, secretary at History and Social Science Department

In the name of the History and Philosophy Honor Society, many thanks.

History and Philosophy Honor Society

Created in 2015, The History and Philosophy Honor Society engage members into the arts of teaching and researching memory and traditions of thought. By empowering and fostering students' interest on History and Philosophy, we aim to strengthen our members' ability to transfer to history and philosophy programs around the nation, and ultimately to graduate school. Trusting on our students' abilities, interests and passions is the soil upon which this organization thrives.

Creada en 2015, La Sociedad Honorífica de Historia y Filosofía expone a sus miembros al arte de enseñar e investigar la memoria y tradiciones de pensamiento. A través de fomentar y empoderar el interés de nuestros alumnos en la Historia y la Filosofía, buscamos facilitar el acceso de nuestros miembros a programas de pregrado así como postgrado a lo largo y ancho del país. La confianza en las habilidades, intereses y pasiones de nuestros alumnos es la piedra angular de esta organización.

Cristóbal Espinoza-Wulach, PhD
Society's adviser

Participant Faculty for academic year 2016-2017:

Terrence Corrigan, PhD: Besides teaching Western Civilization II, Professor Corrigan teaches courses on Modern African History and Holocaust and Genocide. He is the director of the Human Rights and Genocide Center at Middlesex County College and the faculty adviser for Human Rights and Genocide Student Club

Giuseppe Rotolo, PhD: Besides teaching Introduction to Philosophy and Ethics, Professor Rotolo works on issues such as feminist philosophy and gender studies. He is the adviser for the Philosophy Club

Members for academic year 2016– 2017

Members worked with a faculty during the course of the academic year learning the arts teaching and researching different topics associated with history and philosophy.

Samantha Del Piano is a Political Science major planning on double major in History as well. After graduation, she plans to continue my education and further my studies, and potentially earning a PhD. She would like to pursue academia and become a teacher or a professor.

Pierfrancesco Gianinni was born and raised in Florence, Italy. He graduated high school at the Salesian Institute and studied Jurisprudence for a year at the University of Florence. At the age of 27 he decided to move to America to study American English and Philosophy. He became interested in American English and the United States at the age of 8, when his father gave him as present a music cassette of the Nobel Prize Winner, Bob Dylan. He is happily married and currently lives in New Jersey

Priya Singh is in her second year of college, and majoring in History. This upcoming fall, she will be transferring to a four-year school with a major in Genocide Studies, minoring in Middle Eastern Studies. She plans on earning her PhD in History and hopefully using her knowledge to help correct various social and political injustices that are

occurring in this world, or to at least educate those who are contributing in fueling ignorance and bigotry. She believes in human rights and assumes the moral obligation to speak up and take action against those who compromise the lives of others; to help uplift the voices who are being silenced and oppressed.

Winners of the 2016-2017 Essay Contest. Thinking about Education

Fernando Faura resides in Avenel, NJ and currently attends to Middlesex County College with a dual major in Liberal Arts- English and Education. His aspiration is becoming an elementary teacher and bestowing his love of literature to students.

Han Le is an international student coming from Vietnam, majoring in Mathematic at Middlesex County College. She indulges passion for working with numbers and unknowns x , y , z in math problems. It might be a math instructor, a mathematician or an engineer, for she is unsure about what career will lead her life to success and exerting herself on the way to asserting who she really is.

Katsiaryna Sikorskaya is a Nursing student at Middlesex County College, originally from Belarus, a country in Eastern Europe. Katsiaryna has made a career change from being a teacher of English to becoming a nurse. She has a passion for writing and children. Currently, she works at a daycare center on campus and is an active participant in "Reading for Tots program." By being a mother herself, she thinks that childbirth is one of the most amazing things one could ever go through. This experience has bolstered her desire to pursue a career in midwifery. When Katsiaryna is not working she enjoys

giving back to the community by volunteering.

Artist Biographies

Seyma Dereli is a Liberal Arts (General) student who is graduating in Spring 2017. She is hoping to transfer to Rutgers for Fall 2017 for Design Major. She has been always interested in drawing since she was a little girl and today she is doing it as a hobby.

Puhong Li is double major in Fine art and Business Administration. Puhong Li does not have future career goals, as she would like to keeping preparing herself and finding chances to do something. Originally from China, she had lived in the United States for four year.

Contributors' biographies.

Anthony Alexander is a lifelong resident of South Plainfield, New Jersey. A 2011 graduate of South Plainfield High School, Anthony completed his liberal arts education degree at Middlesex County College in 2014. Anthony will graduate with a degree in history from Rider University in 2017 and is a member of Phi Alpha Theta, The National History Honors Society. Anthony's future career and academic interests include education, gender, race and society issues, and investigating America's involvement on the war on terror.

Noah Freire attends Middlesex County College as a Liberal Arts General Major. He love to study history and examine why and how people act the way that they do. Some of his hobbies include traveling, drawing, reading, and helping others. Noah's goal in life is to pursue something that really interests him and that can make a difference in the world, however, small it may be.

Robert Georgi graduated from MCC in 2016 and is currently finishing his undergraduate degree in Sociology at Columbia University, after which he hopes to attend graduate school in the social sciences. From 2003-2010 Rob served in the United States Army, deploying to Afghanistan in '07 and Iraq in '08 and continues to serve by volunteering with Habitat for Humanity to help house the needy, and as an active member of several local Veteran's organizations

Tyler Kerekgyarto is an alumnus of Middlesex County College and an original member of the History and Philosophy Honor Society. He is currently a Junior at Kean University, where he is majoring in History. His main area of interest is Classical History, but he has not decided on a career yet.



Untitled (2016) by Seyma Dereli

Table of Contents

Foreword

H. Ian Smith. Philosophy Glass

Essays by members

Del Piano, Samantha..... 23- 45
 - Ongoing Tensions between U.S. Federal Government
 and Native Americans continue to escalate

Gianinni, Pierfrancesco..... 49- 78
 - I have therefore I am: the vulnerable homo economicus
 of John Locke

Singh, Priya..... 81- 95
 - Preventing Genocide

Winners of the 2016-2017

Essay Contest. Thinking about Education..... 99- 126

Faura, Fernando..... 103-110

Le, Han..... 111- 118

Sikorskaya, Katsiaryna..... 119-126

Notable Papers of the Academic Year 2016-2017

- Freire, Noah..... 129-163
 - The Moorish Influence in Medieval Christian Iberia

Alumni Articles and Essays

- Alexander, Anthony..... 167-231
 - *The Crisis* Magazine. W.E.B. Dubois Instrument for Education and Inspiration
- Georgi, Robert..... 235-248
 - Silence and Its Discontents: The Public Arm of Ginny Baker
- Kerekgyarto, Tyler 251-269
 - A bibliographical essay on the Nuclear Bombings in Hiroshima and Nagasaki



Hopeless Day (2016) by Puhong Li

Philosophy Glass

Escape from Prism
Subject colored views to a
Philosophy Glass

You've seen the light, but is it white? Maybe.
Depends on attitudes inside your head.
For when white light's unlocked by prism's key,
The spectrum ruins from violet to red.

And that's the visible spectrum alone!
Much more remains unseen or else unheard.
Despite the subtle instruments we own.
Much that remains unknown must be inferred.

Clearly, things are not as they may appear.
The origins of things remain obscure.
Philosophers and tourist hold most dear
Not final destinations, but the tour

So join the game, don't settle for arrest
Because it's not the quarry, but the quest!

By H. Ian Smith
Professor of History and Philosophy at Middlesex County
College from 1964 to 1988



Frida (2015) by Seyma Dereli

Ongoing Tensions between U.S. Federal Government and Native Americans continue to escalate

Samantha Del Piano

Introduction

The relationship between Native American tribes and the United States federal government has always been and still remains unstable, from the dawn of the nation up to the present day. Unfortunately, it seems, the prospect of solving this conflict is dim. Rather than two confronting nations or states, the conflict between Native American tribes and United States federal government is a cultural clash. Beginning with the first settlers and continuing through the birth and expansion of the nation it is clear even now the wildly contrasting views on the uses of natural resources between the two parties will continue to escalate as the two ideologies continue to work against each other. In those terms, the conflict over the construction of the Dakota Access Pipeline Line opens a new chapter on a longstanding history of exploiting natural resources in order to secure the prosperity and

wealth for the nation while creating tension with Native American tribes.

Understanding Native American culture

The first encounters with Native Americans consistently document their lifestyles as friendly, open, and minimalistic. In addition to these findings it is also known that Native American tribes also had a deep understanding and respect for their environments. Their understanding of nature is clearly observed in the story of the world's origin, among the Iroquois tribe specifically. In this story it is seen that once a female goddess had fallen from the skyworld, she was saved and various animals had come to her aid in assisting her in the creation of the world and mankind. The story titled, "The World On the Turtle's Back," supports the idea that Native Americans believed man relied on nature and nature chooses to aid and nourish man. For example, the historic Iroquois story can be quoted,

“The birds of the sea saw the woman falling and they immediately consulted with each other as to what they could do to help her. Flying wingtip to wingtip they made a great feathery raft in the sky to support her, and thus broke her fall,” (Hertzberg).

It is seen here the birds coming to the aid of the falling helpless goddess, the parallel to their view point of the purpose of nature can be clearly observed here. To even further prove this claim the story also continues to say the gods saw the woman being cared for beyond the skyworld and in short turned their backs and ignored the fallen goddess offering now help. “The beings up in the Sky-World paid no attention to this. They knew what was happening, but they chose to ignore it,” (Hertzberg). The story seems to suggest less of a reliance upon the gods and more upon the Earth and it’s creatures. Within the story the narrative becomes about what nature has done and continues to do for man, i.e. coming to the goddess’ rescue. The story overall demonstrates the appreciation

Native Americans have for animals and the lands they inhabit. In short, animals and nature allow Native Americans to prosper and grow.

Continuing on, in addition to their religious views Native Americans showed their appreciation and respect for the land through their everyday living. Several reports dating back to the first initial contact between Native Americans and colonists all describe Native Americans as living simply lives. Native Americans believed possessions did not determine the quality of one's life. Living by only what was necessary they avoided living with excess and in addition to this they also did not share in a sense of ownership over their tools and goods. Simplicity was key for the Native Americans, being happy and grateful for what they have, Natives did not keep extra or nonessential items around and shared whatever they had with all in the tribe. This ideal not only extended to those within the tribe but to the strangers they encountered. As documented by one of the first English settlers, Thomas Morton an early leader of a community

located in Massachusetts. In his description of Native life, "Thomas Morton, *The Native Americans Of New England* (1637)," he observed their custom of generosity and openness, stating,

"If any one that shall come into their houses and there fall asleep, when they see him disposed to lie down, they will spread a mat for him of their own accord, and lay a roll of skins...and let him lie. If he sleep until their meal be dished up, they will set a wooden bowl of meat by him that sleepeth and wake him saying...if you be hungry, there is meat for you, where if you will eat you may. Such is their humanity," (Morton).

Moreover, Morton was not alone in his assumptions concerning Native living. French missionary, Father Jean de Brebeuf, described the society of the Huron people located in modern-day Quebec, (Brebeuf). In his writings, "Father Jean de Brebeuf on the Customs and Beliefs of the Hurons (1635)," Brebeuf describes and

overwhelming hospitality, "They never close the door on a stranger, and, once having received him into their houses, they share with him the best they have; they never send him away, and when he goes away of his own accord, he repays them by a simple 'thank you.'," (Brebeuf). In addition to their hospitality and good nature, Morton also made note of their simplistic ideals and communal living, "They love not to be cumbered with many utensils, and although every proprietor knows his own, yet all things, (so long as they will last), are used in common amongst them..." (Morton). The Native Americans being discovered by these first settlers shared in simple open lives and understood nature through religion and their everyday lives. It is unsettling for these new colonists and therefore the stark difference in living comes into contrast.

The first settlers' way of life was inherently different from that of the Native Americans being encountered at this time. To begin, the widely held religion among first settlers was Christianity, which

already creates a contrast between the two parties. In the case of Father Jean de Brebeuf, the french settler was a missionary with the goal of converting the Huron tribe, (Brebeuf). It was in this regard that the contrast between the two parties became evident and the first settlers deduced the Natives were savage due to a lack of understanding of faith. Brebeuf stated, "It is so evident that there is a Divinity who has made Heaven and earth that our Hurons cannot entirely ignore it. But they misapprehend him grossly. For they have neither Temples, nor Priests, nor Feasts, nor any ceremonies," (Brebeuf). Brebeuf took the Huron interpretation of religion, being similar to that of the Iroquois beliefs, as misguided. Hurons also believed, like many other Native American tribes, god and goddesses were in a likeness to themselves and did not celebrate them. Brebeuf attempted to reform these Native Americans to Christianity but to no avail, the Hurons would maintain their faith, (Brebeuf). European settlers, primarily english settlers, also maintained a strong belief in personal property and

prosperity, the whole reason for immigrating being for prosperity, and did not hold much regard for nature in comparison to the Native Americans. During the time many were migrating to there was religious discourse throughout Europe and England in particular became extremely poverty stricken. Poor quality of life, unemployment, and inadequate resources forced many to embark on the journey to a new land full of new promises. The promise for better opportunities led many from their homes in Europe to the newly emerging colonies.

Moving forward, the obvious differences in lifestyle between settlers and Native Americans facilitated a false notion on behalf of the colonists that Native Americans were savage, or uncivilized by their accounts. Referencing back to Father Jean de Brebeuf, who despite acknowledging an extensive language network, which had included gender specifications, numbers, and tense, and religion among 30,000 people, still regarded the Hurons as savage, (Brebeuf). Brebeuf recalls, "They are lazy, are liars, thieves, pertinacious beggars," (Brebeuf). In

addition, Morton also stakes the claim that the Native Americans are uncivilized and savage and even moves to say the Native Americans were guilty of practicing witchcraft. Morton states, "If we do not judge amiss of these savages in accounting them witches,...some correspondence they have with the Devil out of all doubt," (Morton). Believing the leaders of the tribe used witchcraft to captivate the tribe, Morton also made the bold analysis that Natives were without religion, law, and king, simply making them inferior to settlers. This attitude begins to set the nation for the present conditions we are experiencing between Native American Tribes today and the U.S. federal government.

Tensions began to arise fairly quickly between colonists and Native Americans as colonist begin to establish territories and profit from the land. Most notably the example of Jamestown can be used to summarise the origins of said tensions. As settlers first landed on American soil, Native Americans were detrimental to the survival of the first colonies. Natives had taught settlers to

grow various crops, in the example of Jamestown, tobacco. Jamestown's economy was largely based around the growth of tobacco, the crop bred prosperity for the colony. By the year 1613 the plantation owned by John Rolfe had saved the colony of Jamestown, however the crop itself required lots of land to maintain as steady profit and as a result tensions between settlers had begun. By the year 1620, the nature of the tensions had escalated and the Powhatan tribe that had been effected retaliated. Attacking and destroying the colony the Natives killed 3/4th of the population of Jamestown for the encroachment onto their territories. However, Jamestown recovered and by 1624 was considered a royal colony due to tobacco expansion. The efforts of the Powhatan tribe proving to be in vain against the expansion of the colonies. What initially began as a mutually beneficial relationship has turned into a struggle between two ways of life.

From the founding fathers to Reservations Policy.

The conflict between early settlers and Native American continued as the colonies formed a new country: the United States. At the ideological center of the American Revolution is possible to observed Enlightenment and John Locke. While this ideology reinforced ideas about equality and government responsibility towards citizens, it also reinforced ideas associated with property ownership. John Locke, made his claims on "The Second Treatise on Civil Government (1689)." Locke believed in natural rights of man and equality, but more specifically tailored to white settlers. Locke plainly states man has the right to property and liberty as the Lord has given man the world to make him prosperous. "God, who hath given the world to men in common, hath also given them reason to make use of it to the best advantage of life and convenience," (Locke). In addition Locke states, "Through the earth and its inferior creatures be common to all men, yet every man has a 'property' in his own 'person.' This nobody has any right to but himself. The 'labor' of his

body and the 'work' of his hands, we may say, are properly his," (Locke). It is this ideology that began with Locke that sets the tone for the birth of the Nation. The United States of America was born under the pretense of Locke's ideology, which was perpetuated by our founding fathers during the creation of the nation. It continues to influence modern day politics just as it had influenced the second wave of enlightenment of the country or the brink of expansion past the Mississippi into the west.

Unsurprisingly, the new federal government of the United States of America by the 1800's did very little to de-escalate the tensions with Native Americans. On the contrary, the federal government facilitated further conflicts which had reached its peak by 1830, with former President Andrew Jackson's Indian Removal Act which would forcibly remove several thousands of Native Americans across various tribes from the east of the Mississippi. In his own message to congress, "President Andrew Jackson's Message to Congress 'On Indian Removal' (1830)," President Andrew Jackson stated,

“The consequences of speedy removal will be important to the United States, to individual states, and to the Indians themselves. The pecuniary advantages which it promises to the Government are the least of its recommendations. It puts an end to all possible danger of collision between the authorities of the General and State Governments on account of the Indians...It will relieve the whole State of Mississippi and the western part of Alabama of Indian occupancy, and enable those States to advance rapidly in population, wealth, and power,” (Jackson).

Jackson’s legislation secured the prosperity of the nation but at the cost of the rights and lives of the Native Americans who also had claim to the land, even before the first settlers. Following the Indian removal act came the Treaty of New Echota, which in the remnants of the Indian Removal Act, was directed to the Cherokee tribe of Native Americans who had been the last to move to the

west of the Mississippi. The account of General Winfield Scott in his address to the Cherokee Nation concerning the Treaty of New Echota suggests the federal government was more than willing to forcibly remove the Native tensions created to secure prosperity for the United States. Subjecting Native Americans to this kind of treatment has only served to further alienated Native Americans from the federal government. Gen. Scott announced to the cherokees, "My troops already occupy many positions in the country that you are to abandon, and thousands and thousands are approaching from every quarter, to render resistance and escape alike hopeless," (General Winfield Scott). Continuing onward, the Cherokee nation did subsequently suffer following these acts, which had stripped the Native Americans of basic rights. In the wake of the Indian Removal Act and Treaty of New Echota came the trail of tear where it is estimated around 4,000 Cherokees had perished at the hands of the military carrying out and unjust order. Private John G. Burnett was sent as interpreter into Smoky Mountain country May

1838 and recounts the instances of brutality against Cherokee Indians under the Indian Removal Act. "Being acquainted with many of the Indians and able to fluently speak their language, I was sent as interpreter into the Smoky Mountain Country in May, 1838, and witnessed the execution of the most brutal order in the History of American Warfare," (Burnett). The convoy of Cherokee suffered thousands of deaths due to ill treatment, cold, exposure, and poor travel conditions. By the journey's end in March 1839, 4,000 Cherokee graves dotted the landscape from the Smoky Mountains into Indian Territory. The idea of prosperity for the nation with the proposal of Manifest Destiny and westward expansion took precedent over the welfare and basic rights of Native Americans. As a result, by federal mandate thousands of Native Americans were forced from their homes and forced to endure brutality and cruelty.

"The long painful journey to the west ended March 26th, 1839, with four-thousand silent graves reaching from the

foothills of the Smoky Mountains to what is known as Indian territory in the West. And covetousness on the part of the white race was the cause of all that the Cherokees had to suffer," (Burnett).

Burnett agrees the greed was the final motivation behind the removal of Native Americans. Once the territory has been cleared the idea of Manifest Destiny took hold of the people and again Native Americans were forced to suffer. Suffering first in the form of genocide the remaining tribes would then be subjugated to reservations as the white man supported under federal government attempted to civilize, or in other words culturally cleanse the Native Americans of their beliefs. The ideology of expansion lead to the rise of manifest destiny which supported claims such as social darwinism, and the claim that it is the destiny of white men to expand to and civilize the west. Reservations served to civilize and convert Native Americans but it genuinely succeeded in removing the identity and culture from the newly emerging

generation of young Native Americans following the Indian Removal Act. In the work, "A Native American Tries to Walk the White Man's Road (1890s)," a young native boy describes life attending the white school established for Native Americans and the consequences of abandoning one's traditions for another set of traditions. The young boy had attended the school for several years, all the while immersing himself in the ways and beliefs of white men. While eating their food and wearing their clothes teachers repeatedly taught the young Native Americans that their ways are wrong and uncivilized. The young native recalls,

"They told us that Indian ways were bad. They said we must get civilized. I remember that word too. It means, 'be like the white man.' I am willing to be like the white man, but I did not believe Indian ways were wrong. But they kept teaching us for seven years. And the books told how bad the Indians had been to the white men- burning their towns and killing their women and children. But I had

seen white men do that to Indians,” (Native American, 1890s). The catholic school teachers repeatedly attempted to strip the young students of their Native American identities by having them reject their ways. Unfortunately, after years of this kind of treatment the Native American was outcasted from his tribe for being too much like the white man, meanwhile he was still not accepted fully by white Americans either. The man never returned to his pueblo rather he stayed closely outside of its borders. “I built a house just outside of the pueblo. I would not live in the pueblo so I built outside a house bigger than the pueblo houses all for myself,” (Embree).

Conclusions

Overall, tension between the Native Americans and U.S. federal government have escalated due to their troubled and entangled past. The history of treatment between the Natives and settlers proves the problem is rooted at the very beginning of the nation. The Nation has continued to expand into modern day and again we see a rise in

conflicts. The most recent of conflicts to arise concerns the Dakota Access Pipeline which is set in the heart of Native American lands. Standing Rock Sioux Reservation has been the focal point for recent protest at the 1,172 mile long pipeline threatens Native territory and the water supply on which the people at Standing Rock rely upon, (Aisch, Lai). However, construction under the federal government has been steady and has maintained itself as necessary for the wellbeing of the nation. The recent Presidential Memorandum concerning the Dakota Access Pipeline can be quoted,

“This approximately 1,100-mile pipeline is designed to carry approximately 500,000 barrels per day of crude oil from the Bakken and Three Forks oil production areas in North Dakota to oil markets in the United States. At this time, the DAPL is more than 90 percent complete across its entire route. Only a limited portion remains to be constructed. I believe that construction and operation of

lawfully permitted pipeline infrastructure serve the national interest," (Presidential Memorandum).

It seems the wellbeing of the nation will once again trump the needs and rights of Native Americans as construction continues and the protests escalate. The fear of the Native American people is that the pipeline will contaminate the reservations source of drinking water as well as damage sacred lands,(Aisch, Lai). "There have been large protests at the Lake Oahe crossing over potential water contamination and the damage of sacred tribal sites. The Missouri River is the Standing Rock Sioux Tribe's primary source of drinking water," (Aisch, Lai).

Overall, there is a long and well documented history of the struggles between Native Americans and the federal government. Beginning with simply differences the lifestyle between early settlers and early natives at the birth of the colonies has grown to full blown conflict. The expansion of the nation has brought with it an expansion of tensions between the two parties. The

ideologies responsible for the tensions are still at play in modern times which suggests a continuation of the conflicts that transpire between the two.

Works Cited

- Burnett, John G. Private. "A Soldier Recalls the Trail of Tears." *A Soldier Recalls the Trail of Tears - North Carolina Digital History*. N.p., n.d. Web. Feb. 2017.
- De Brebeuf, Jean. "Father Jean De Brebeuf on the Customs and Beliefs of the Hurons (1635)." *Voices of Freedom*. By John Greenleaf Whittier. Philadelphia: T.S. Cavender, 1846. N. pag. Print.
- Embree, Edwin R. "A Native American Tries to Walk the White Man's Road (1890s)." *Indians of the Americas: Historical Pageant*. Boston: n.p., 1939. N. pag. Print.
- Gregor Aisch and K.k. Rebecca Lai. "The Conflicts Along 1,172 Miles of the Dakota Access Pipeline." *The New York Times*. The New York Times, 23 Nov. 2016. Web. Feb. 2017.
- Hertzberg, Hazel W. "The World On The Turtle's Back (Iroquois Story)." *The Great Tree and the Longhouse: The Culture of the Iroquois*. Londen: Collier-Macmillan Limited, 1966. N. pag. Print.

- Locke, John. "Second Treatise." *John Locke: Two Treatises of Government* (n.d.): 265-428.
- Morton, Thomas. "Thomas Morton, The Native Americans of New England (1637)." *Voices of Freedom*. By John Greenleaf Whittier. Philadelphia: T.S. Cavender, 1846. N. pag. Print.
- President Jackson's Message to Congress "On Indian Removal", December 6, 1830; Records of the United States Senate, 1789-1990; Record Group 46; Records of the United States Senate, 1789-1990; National Archives.
- "Presidential Memorandum Regarding Construction of the Dakota Access Pipeline." *The White House*. The United States Government, 24 Jan. 2017. Web. Feb. 2017.
- Scott, Winfield Gen. "Major General Scott's Ultimatum," Edward J. Cashin (ed.), *A Wilderness Still The Cradle of Nature: Frontier Georgia (Savannah: Beehive Press, 1994)*, pp.137-38.



Break phase (2016) by Puhong Li

I have therefore I am: the vulnerable homo economicus of John Locke.

Pierfrancesco Gianinni

1. *Locke's argument*

John Locke places the right to private property on equal level with the natural rights to life and liberty. I will present an argument to prove that the natural right to property fails to be convincing; my intent, it is not the conceptual and/or practical abolition of such right, or disputing the possibility of having rights that exist before and independently from civil and political society, rather, to show the consequences that derive from introducing the right to private property in the category of natural rights¹.

Before showing the issues in Locke's political philosophy, it is necessary to study, analyze and

¹ Natural rights are those that are not dependent on the laws or customs of any particular culture or government. They are not invented or created, but only found already existent in nature either by reason or revelation. Legal rights are those bestowed onto a person by a given legal system, therefore an invention of men.

summarize his theories. Whether through natural reason or revelation, he claims, men have the right to their preservation, they find themselves created into a world that does not belong to anybody in particular; the earth and everything in it is given to them in common by God, and yet there is one thing that must not, and cannot be shared, of which every man can claim to be the only master: his own person. "Though the earth, and all inferior creatures, be common to all men, yet every man has a property in his own person: this nobody has any right but himself ²." He continues by adding: "The labor of his body, and the work of his hands, we may say, are properly his. Whatsoever he removes out of the state of nature has provided, and left in it, he has mixed the labor with and joined to it something that his own, and thereby makes it his property³." If I own my body, what I produce with it becomes mine by default, it is an extension of me that no one can separate and own, neither by force, nor by

² John Locke, *Second Treatise of Government*, 1690. C.B Macpherson, *Second Treatise of Government*, 1980

³ Ibidem

right. He seems to have discovered an undeniable pre-legal/pre-positive arrangement between the individual and his own body. According to Locke, men are property acquiring animals to whom the world is given to be improved, unlike Plato and Aristotle (and generally the Greek world of that time) who thought that economy had to be somehow less relevant when compared to knowledge and wisdom. Now the world belongs to the “industrious and the rational” he claims, to those whom by their labor increase the richness of all: “God, when he gave the world in common to all mankind, commanded man also to labour... [] since he gave it them for their benefit, and the greatest convenience of life they were capable to draw it from it, it cannot be supposed he meant it should always remain in common and uncultivated.⁴” He continued by saying: “ ... it was a foolish thing, as well as dishonest, to hoard up more than he could make use of.⁵” This suggests that there is a limitation to man’s

⁴ Ibidem

⁵ Ibidem

accumulation of property in that, excessive greed, would be damaging to other men; however, it turns out that there is no natural law to limit acquisition of property, the introduction of money into the state of nature makes unlimited accumulation of richness both good and necessary; it becomes our duty to work on the God given land: “ .. and thus came in the use of money, some lasting thing that men might keep without spoiling, and that by mutual consent men would take in exchange for the truly useful, but perishable supports of life. And as different degrees of industry were apt to give men possessions in different proportions, so this invention of money gave them the opportunity to continue to enlarge them.”⁶

2. Private property, religion, and the beginning of the critique.

Private property, in my opinion, can be regarded as important as the natural rights to life and liberty like in Locke’s philosophy, only when connected to the

⁶ John Locke, *Second Treatise of Government* 1690. *Second Treatise of Government*, C.B Mcpherson 1980

Calvinistic belief which ascribes to hard work (labor) the main sign for the individual of being the one chosen by God for salvation. He who through his labor acquires property, not only has the right to exclude everyone from what he possesses, but becomes certain of being the right moral character God has chosen to save. Private property is the solid, tangible result and proof of the activity of working, its material manifestation. Salvation, for the believer, is individual, private, and not collective. He is on his own. There is no social or collective responsibility. It's privately related to his being a hard worker.

Given the time in which he lived, along with his upbringing, Locke's philosophy may have been influenced by Calvinism, the belief-system for which the political and cultural battles were fought in the nations where capitalism was most highly developed: England was one of them. Where the rule of predestination was recognized, the believer consistently asked himself this question: Am I one of the elect? How can I be sure of my selection? Good works are indispensable signs of election.

The glory of God is increased by works. According to Max Weber, in his "The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism" "instead of humble sinners to whom Luther promised grace if they entrusted themselves to God to penitent faith, tireless labor in a calling was urged as the best possible means of attaining this self-assurance. This and this alone would drive away religious doubt and give assurance of one's state of grace."

The works do not directly cause salvation, but show the believer that his inclination to labor is a sign of being among those who have been chosen to be saved.

The extent to which Locke was influenced by Calvinism or religion in general is not easy to detect. Even if it's prudent to say that he was not an atheist, reason is omnipresent throughout his philosophy, and it seems to perfectly coexist with faith. He wrote: "Faith is nothing but a firm Assent of the Mind: which if it be regulated, as is our Duty, cannot be afforded to anything but upon good Reason; and so cannot be opposite to it. He that believes, without having any Reason for believing, may be

in love with his own Fancies; but neither seeks Truth as he ought, nor pays the Obedience due his Maker, who would have him use those discerning Faculties he has given him, to keep him out of mistake and error.⁷”

What it is significant, and it is indeed the purpose of this paper, it is not criticizing Locke’s system of Government, the existence of unalienable rights like life and liberty, or to undermine the importance of the protection of the fruits of labor; instead, to point out the danger that derives from the excessive emphasis given to objects, as if it were from their possessions that men gain their worth and the social contract be written.

We can summarize the first objection to Locke’s idea of labor as follow: 1) “with the rising of the worth of possessions, proceeds in the reverse path the devaluation of the world of men. Labor produces not only goods: it produces itself and the worker as a commodity.⁸”

⁷ John Locke, *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding*.1689. Roger Whoolhouse, 2004

⁸ Karl Marx, *Economic and Philosophic Manuscripts of 1844*. Prometheus Books 1988

2) "Labor ceases to be an activity in that it becomes a material object which exists distinctly and independently from the worker, it's the objectification of labor and laborer. Labor realization is its objectification⁹." 3) "Man distinguishes himself from other animals in that makes his life activity the object of his will (the industrious man for God is superior to the other animals according to Locke), in that in working up the objective world, he proves himself to be a *species being*; while animals only produce what they immediately need for themselves, man also forms things in accordance with the law of beauty. He contemplates himself in the world he creates. But in tearing away from man the object of his production, estranged labor tears from him his species life and transform his advantage over animals into disadvantage, he loses consciousness of his species in degrading spontaneous activity, free activity, to a means and coercion.¹⁰" (Marx)

⁹ Ibidem

¹⁰ Ibidem

Locke is vague when he talks about “labor”, he does not see that when it is not the product of man’s free creativity, like Michelangelo making his David, but it is coerced, pre-ordered in all its form (like the worker in the factory that makes the same object over and over again throughout his whole life), man no longer feels to be freely active in any but his animal functions of drinking, eating, and reproducing.

An immense consequence of the fact that man is estranged from the product of his labor, from his life activity, and from his *species being*, is the estrangement of man from man. “Within the relationship of estranged labor each man views the other in accordance with the standard and the position in which he finds himself as a worker.¹¹”

This is crucial to understand and explain the nature of conflicts among men (*homo homini lupus*), the dehumanization in slavery, in any act of war, but also in the competitiveness expressed in everyday society. We

¹¹ *Ibidem*

should not devalue labor per se, but recognize that “the mode of being” should not be replaced by “the mode of having” (Erich Fromm). The second Treatise of Government, which is beyond doubt one of the greatest political philosophy work, it is unarguably the Manifesto of capitalism. Even though Locke missed the consequences of the Industrial Revolution, and the employment of workers in the factories, he clearly gave importance to the acquisitive mode of existing of all men. Their main qualification is, along with their rationality, their ‘industriousness’, their inclination to labor, and a mercantile business logic. The function of Governments is the protection of private property and the safety of its citizens, yet private property and the acquisitive mode of existence is at the same time one of the causes of conflicts among men, and the existential uncertainty of the individual.

“The nature of the having mode of existence follows from the nature of private property. In this mode of existence

all that matters are my acquisition of property, and my unlimited right to keep what I have acquired. The having mode exclude others. The sentence "I have something" expresses the relation between the subject and the object. The subject is not myself, but I am what I have. My property constitutes myself.¹²"

What happens if I lose what I have? I am not. Because if I am what I have, if my existence is characterized essentially by what I have, then if I lose what I have, I cease to exist. Considering that objects are perishable, this mode of existence renders men very fragile. In a society in which, the property of a house, or a piece of land, are the essence and its main goals, you have a population whose existence and serenity is constantly threatened by the possibility of nothing.

"While private ownership is supposed to be a natural and universal category, it is in fact an exception rather than the

¹² Eric Fromm, *To have or To be*. 1976. Bloomsbuty Academic 2016

rule if we consider the whole of human history, and in particular the cultures outside of Europe in which economy was not life's main concern.¹³"

The Native Americans, essentially hunters and gatherers, had never established any property relationship with the land they had inhabited for thousands of years. Their relationship with objects was not the kind of ownership proper to an industrialized society. Nature was not something given by God to exploit limitlessly, it was God itself. They did not own nature, they worshipped it. Their economy followed the *mode of being*, not the *mode of having*. They did not possess nature, they experienced and venerated it.

The acquisitive mode consecrated by Locke, and its contrast, can be shown by two examples of poetic expression that Eric Fromm presents in his book "to have or to be". The nineteenth-century English poet, Tennyson and the Japanese poet Basho in the seventeenth-century.

¹³ ibidem

Tennyson¹⁴:

*Flower in a crannied wall,
I pluck you out of the crannies,
I hold you here, root and all, in my hand,
Little flower- but if I could understand
What you are, root and all, and all in all,
I should know what God and man is.*

Basho: *When I look carefully*

*I see the nazuna blooming
By the edge*

Eric Fromm's interpretation and comparison is striking and shows exactly the differences between The Native Americans' culture and that of the Europeans who came to America.

"Tennyson, it appears, needs to possess the flower in order to understand people and nature, and by his

¹⁴ Alfred, Lord, Tennyson, *Flower I a crannied wall*. 1863. Eric Fromm, *To have or to be* 1976. Bloomsbury Academic 2016

having it, the flower is destroyed. What Basho wants is to see, and not only to look at the flower, but be at one, to “one” himself with it- and let it live.”

Fromm continues by showing Goethe¹⁵'s poem:

“I walked in the woods

All by myself,

To seek nothing,

That was on my mind.

I saw in the shade

A little flower stand,

Bright like the stars

Like beautiful eyes.

I wanted to pluck it,

But is said sweetly:

Is it to wilt

That I must be broken?

I took it out

With all its roots,

Carried it to the garden

¹⁵ Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Faust*, 1832. Eric Fromm, *To have or To be*. Bloomsbury Academic 2016

*At the pretty house.
 And planted it again
 In a quiet place;
 Now it ever spreads
 And blossoms forth."*

Goethe had at first the identical desire as Tennyson, the acquisitive mode was in him, but he realized that doing so he would have killed the flower. He found a way in the middle between the English poet and the Japanese one.

3. The replacement of a culture

The placement of the right to private property to the same level to the right to life and liberty, indicates that the very existence of men and their freedoms are necessarily bound to the objects they possess. Even knowledge is something we have. The language, too, changes. I am not a knowledgeable man, I have knowledge. The verb "to have" replaces many times the verb "to be". I do not see

the flower, I have it, I possess it. I do not live and experience nature, I possess it. When the European came to America, some crossed the ocean for religious purposes, but many to become richer than they already were, and approached the Natives in a manner proper to the *having mode*. They plucked out the land from the Indians like the flower in the poem, though not for the knowledge of it, but for its lucrative exploitation. They completely dehumanized the Indians and disregarded the fact that they had been there for thousands of years.

According to Locke's thought, the world is given by God in common to all men; by their working on the land, they establish an exclusive relationship to it: private property. Working on the land means practicing agriculture, not hunting and gathering. For this theory, the Natives, who were prevalently hunters and gatherers, never established any relationship of property with the land they had inhabited. If what makes a man a good moral character is his rationality and industriousness, his ability to work and improve the God's given land and

natural resources, then the Indians who just hunted animals and worshipped nature in a contemplative way, did not possess those qualities that distinguish a human being from the rest of the animals, and certainly were not good moral character who understood and obey God's command. This view of life and existence could explain the reason why some of the Europeans that came to America felt both morally and legally legitimized to take over everything. It was not just for the mere profit they could gain, it was also a moral duty not to waste an immense quantity of God given land. The natives certainly did not show any sign for which they were chosen by God for salvation. They completely lacked of the Protestant ethic of hard work and obedience to God, they lacked the spirit of capitalism that can be observed in the Autobiography of Benjamin Franklyn¹⁶:

¹⁶ Benjamin Franklyn, *Autobiography of Benjamin Franklyn* 1791. Millennium Publications 2015

“Remember, that time is money. He that can earn ten shillings a day by his labour, and goes abroad, or sits idle, one half of that day, though he spends but sixpence during his diversion or idleness, ought not to reckon that the only expense; he has really spent, or rather thrown away, five shillings besides. Remember, that credit is money. If a man lets his money lie in my hands after it is due, he gives me the interest, or so much as I can make of it during that time. This amounts to a considerable sum where a man has good and large credit, and makes good use of it. Remember, that money is of the prolific, generating nature. Money can beget money, and its offspring can beget more, and so on. Five shillings turned is six, turned again it is seven and three pence, and so on, till it becomes a hundred pounds [...] Remember this saying, the good paymaster is lord of another man’s purse. He that is known to pay punctually and exactly to the time he promises, may at any time, and on any occasion, raise all the money his friends can spare. This is sometimes of great use. After industry and frugality,

nothing contributes more to the raising of a young man in the world than punctuality and justice in all his dealings; therefore never keep borrowed money an hour beyond the time you promised, lest a disappointment shut up your friend's purse for ever. The most trifling actions that affect a man's credit are to be regarded. The sound of your hammer at five in the morning, or eight at night, heard by a creditor, makes him easy six months longer; but if he sees you at a billiard-table, or hears your voice at a tavern, when you should be at work, he sends for his money the next day; demands it, before he can receive it, in a lump. It shows, besides, that you are mindful of what you owe; it makes you appear a careful as well as an honest man, and that still increases your credit."

Here everything, even morality, it's valued according to its usefulness. Honesty is useful insofar as it brings credit. The goal of man's life is making money, where hard work is not just a mere means to get something else, but it is an end in itself. The Native American populations were very creative, their creation of

artworks was huge and astonishingly beautiful, but everything that was made was either as a form of worship to nature or to meet the biological needs: food and shelter. They worked to live, not vice versa. What the Europeans aimed to do (and they did) was not just taking over the land, but also replacing an entire culture with another; a culture, a spirit that was far more functional to the productive/ mercantile ethic.

It becomes almost “self-evident”, to use an expression dear to the Founding Fathers, to understand, now, why the right to acquire property (and keep it) could not be just a positive right, a contingent right, that could be destroyed and replaced in any moment by those who had made it up. It had to be a natural right, whose essence and existence was not a creation of some men, at some point, in some place, but it was an unalienable right that was either *found* through reason or *revealed* by faith.

Hegel grounded the theory of inalienable rights on the inalienability of those features of personhood that differentiate subjects from objects. A thing, like a piece of

land, can be shifted from one person to another. According to Hegel, the same would not apply to those characteristics that make one a human being.

“The right to what is in essence inalienable is imprescriptible, since the act whereby I take possession of my personality, of my substantive essence, and make myself a responsible being, capable of possessing rights and with a moral and religious life, takes away from these characteristics of mine just that externality which alone made them capable of passing into the possession of someone else. When I have thus annulled their externality, I cannot lose them through lapse of time or from any other reason drawn from my prior consent or willingness to alienate them.¹⁷”

Placing the right to property among the natural rights to life and liberty, either derives from the confusion

¹⁷ George W.F Hegel, *Philosophy of Right*.1821. Oxford University Press 1967

between subject-object relationship where it becomes impossible to clearly make a definitive distinction, or it is the cause of this impossibility.

4. *Different views on human nature*

Hobbes' understanding of natural rights derived from his consideration of man in a "state of nature", arguing that the essential natural right was "to use his own power, as he will himself, for the preservation of his own Nature; that is to say, of his own Life; and consequently, of doing anything, which in his own judgement, and Reason, he shall conceive to be the aptest means thereunto."¹⁸

Within this natural state, the life of men consisted of liberties and not of laws, "It followeth, that in such a condition, every man has the right to every thing; even to one another's body. And therefore, as long as this natural Right of every man to every thing endureth, there can be

¹⁸ Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan*. 1651. *Leviathan*, Penguins Books 1968

no security to any man... of living out the time, which Nature ordinarily allow men to live¹⁹.

As a consequence of such human nature, a war of all against all would become unavoidable, a condition in which human beings kill and steal for their natural inclination to "gain, safety, and reputation". The world of chaos brought about by "unlimited rights" would cause human life to be "solitary, poor, nasty, brutish, and short". Therefore, the necessity of a *Social Contract*, as Hobbes wrote: "... before the names of Just and Unjust can have place, there must be some coercive Power, to compel men equally to the performance of their Covenants..., to make good that Propriety, which by mutual contract men acquire, in recompense of the universal Right they abandon: and such power there is none before the erection of the Commonwealth."

While for Hobbes, war, violence and fear characterized the state of nature, a time and place in which civil society and all its institutions have not been

¹⁹ Ibidem

established, for Locke meant “a state of perfect freedom to order their actions, and dispose of their possession and persons, as they think fit, within the bound of nature, without asking leave, or depending upon the will of any other man. A state also of equality, wherein all the power and jurisdiction is reciprocal, no one having more than another; there be nothing more evident, than that creature of the same species and rank, promiscuously born to all the same advantage of nature, and the use of the same faculties, should also be equal one amongst another without subordination or subjection²⁰”.

Locke and Hobbes have different views about what characterizes human nature (if such a thing really exists), but it might also be interesting to illustrate Mandeville’s²¹ thought about the condition of men before any social contract: “ For if by society we only mean a number of people, that without rule or government should keep

²⁰ John, Locke, *Second Treatise of Government*, 1690. C.B Macpherson 1980

²¹ Bernard Mandeville, *A search into the nature of society* 1723. *A search into the nature of society* ,Hackett Publishing Company, Inc 1997

together out of a natural affection to their species or love of company, as a herd of cows or a flock of sheep, then there is not in the world a more unfit creature for society than man. A hundred of them that should be all equals, under no subjection, or fear of any superior upon Earth, could never live together awake two hours without quarreling, and the more knowledge, strength, wit, courage and resolution there was among them, the worse it would be." Both Hobbes and Mandeville, though without possessing the same "formula" to resolve the issues in the state of nature, believe that the essence of human nature leads quickly and inevitably to conflict (vanity in the case of the latter), and they seem to agree about how Locke fails to recognize it.

Locke, and in my opinion, Mandeville and Hobbes, fail to realize that private property is the product of man's alienation. Man, as a subject, loses himself into the world of objects so that he becomes one. The world of objects that he craves limitlessness to possess, becomes more important than the world of subjects. It is not a surprise to

see in some of modern penal codes, that self-defense comprises also the protection of the objects of property, to the extent, for instance, that the owner of a house is legitimized by the law to shoot and kill the thief even when, not his life, but only his property is in danger. In this deplorable scenario, the defense of private property (object), of which the government is the main guarantor, becomes more important than the life of the thief (subject). This is not, obviously, to legitimize thefts or any attack on properties, which must be prosecuted, but to underline where the emphasis stands.

5. The misuse of language in an ontological confusion

The right to private property, which I strongly believe must be protected, should not be placed in the realm of natural rights; while life and liberty coincide with the very existence of men, private property, which has to do with a mere external object from the subject, does not; only when the object gains the same ontological value of the subject, it becomes possible to have the same right for both. "...

yet every man has a property in his own person.²²”
“Whatsoever then he removes out of the state of nature hath provided, and left it in, he hath mixed his labor with, and joined to it something that is his own, and thereby makes his property.²³”

Again, it is clear through these words, that it is like if the subject working on the external world, loses himself in it. The subject mixes himself into the object to the extent that it is difficult to make between them a distinction, therefore, a single right protecting both becomes somehow justified.

In the state of nature, where nobody possesses anything yet, except for their own person, the relationship is only among subjects; in this state, the only contended objects are those necessary to meet primary needs. Those objects coincide with men’s necessary needs, not with men

²² John Locke, *Second Treatise Of Government*.1690. C.B Macpherson 1980

²³ Ibidem

themselves. There is no ontological confusion, in that objects here are only functional to men's existence, they do not constitute it. If we further investigate into the use of language and the meaning of concepts, we may realize that "private property" is an idea which we associate with an object through the use of language, it is not an actual physical object. When we say private property, we automatically associate it with something tangible: a car, a house, and so forth; the protection of private property, or the right to it, it is not about an object that we possess, but is the defense of an ideal (connected to an object) that we have made up. Since it is something that has been postulated, and not found in nature, we should not be talking about natural right to it, but merely as a legal right to it: the placement of private property into the category of natural rights is therefore a mistake.

Bibliography

- John, Locke, *Second Treatise of Government*, 1690. C.B Macpherson, *Second Treatise of Government*, 1980.
- John, Locke, *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding*. Roger Whoolhouse, 2004.
- Karl, Marx, *Economic and Philosophic Manuscripts of 1844*. Prometheus Books, 1988.
- Eric, Fromm, *To have or To be*. 1976. Bloomsbuty Academic, 2016.
- Alfred, Lord, Tennyson, *Flower I a crannied wall*. 1863.
Eric
- Johann Wolfgang von, Goethe, *Faust*, 1832.
- Benjamin, Franklyn, *Autobiography of Benjamin Franklyn* 1791. Millennium Publications, 2015.
- George W.F, Hegel, *Philosophy of Right*.1821. Oxford University Press, 1967.
- Thomas, Hobbes, *Leviathan*. 1651. Leviathan, Penguins Books, 1968.

- Bernard, Mandeville, "A search into the nature of society 1723." *A search into the nature of society*, Hackett Publishing Company, Inc. 1997



Red lights (2017) by Seyma Dereli

Preventing Genocide.

Priya Singh

On December 9 of 1948, the United Nations General Assembly adopted the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (CPPCG). The convention provided a legal definition of genocide and with agreement through signature, the signatories ultimately agreed to hold responsibility in suppressing and punishing perpetrators of genocide and genocidal acts. Under this convention, participating countries are required to prevent and punish actions of genocide, whether carried out in war or in peacetime, but the convention, like the United Nations, proved to be faulty.

Genocide is defined in Article 2 of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (1948) as

"any of the following acts committed with intent to destroy, in whole or in part, a national, ethnical, racial or religious group, as such: killing members of the group; causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group; deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to bring about its physical destruction in whole or in part; imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group; [and] forcibly transferring children of the group to another group."

The UN has established an absolute definition of genocide and what is included under the specifications, and yet, the United Nations has failed the world in preventing genocidal acts from occurring. From the Holocaust to Darfur, and every malicious, ill willed event in between, millions of innocent lives have been lost and the power struggle of superiority and supremacy has continued. With reevaluation and complete redistribution of power within and of the United Nations, and the

relative councils, future genocides can be prevented and present ones can be put to an end.

Since the holocaust, multiple genocides have occurred and the United Nations has stood on the sidelines. The UN has actively contributed in turning a blind eye to mass killings, war crimes, and unjustifiable acts of bias terrorism. In relevance to their contribution to genocide, whether voluntary or involuntary, is the refusal of recognizing genocide in its occurrence. The United Nations has a detrimental habit of only recognizing genocides after a sizeable amount of people have been killed relentlessly, and even then recognition of these brutal acts is subjective and vague. The United Nations also has a notable reputation of only recognizing genocides and acts of genocides in times of convenience or when they are publically ridiculed or condemned. Examples of this include (but are not limited to) Bangladesh (1971), Cambodia (1975-1979), Bosnia (1992-1995), Rwanda (1994), and Darfur (2004-ongoing). Even with these genocides listed, many members of various

councils within the United Nations do not recognize or even consider these events as genocide.

On March 26 of 1971, Pakistan began a mass genocide in Bangladesh. West Pakistan's military began to dictate the Eastern side of the nation and began to oppress the Bengalis. It was "during the nine-month-long Bangladesh war for independence, members of the Pakistani military and supporting militias killed an estimated 300,000 to 3,000,000 people and raped between 200,000 and 400,000 Bangladeshi women" (Alston 40) and in addition, committed "a systematic campaign of genocidal rape" (Sharlach 92-93). An estimation of "up to 30 million civilians became internally displaced" (Alston 40) and were forced to relocate. The war showcased an ethnic cleansing and extreme violence against Bengalis (Muslims and Hindus primarily), Bihari Muslims, and Bengali supporters during the war.

The cleansing of (primarily) Bengalis was perpetrated by the Pakistani military and enforced by the government. Like the holocaust, this genocide would not

have been possible without racist viewings, bigoted perceptions, or enforced prejudices. According to R. J. Rummel, the professor of political science at the University of Hawaii, the genocide and various atrocities were also perpetrated by lower-ranking officers and ordinary soldiers. These "willing executioners" were stimulated by abiding anti-Bengali racism. "Bengalis were often compared with monkeys and chickens"; they were dehumanized like the Jews were by Nazis, and were seen in the same light- they were seen as less than human and not worthy of living. In additional evidence of the dehumanization of Bengalis was "at a meeting on 22 February 1971, the Pakistani President General Yahya Khan is recorded as saying in fury: 'Kill three million of them, and the rest will eat out of our hands'" (Hewitt 287). The hatred and attempt to annihilate the Bengalis was enforced and advocated by the Pakistani government and officials, and is no different than Nazi Germany's hope to exterminate the Jews from Europe.

With the United Nation's definition of genocide in mind, it should be very clear to recognize that the displacement, ethnic and religious cleansing, forced relocation, mass rapes, and denial of these acts does indeed constitute as genocide. However, the United Nation as a whole never released a statement agreeing that what happened with Pakistan and Bangladesh was indeed a genocide, and the United States, a very big power with the United Nations, at one point even blatantly refused to acknowledge the cleansings as anything other than tragic occurrences of war.

During President Nixon's term, Nixon viewed Pakistan as a cold war ally and refused to condemn their genocidal actions. From the White House tapes "The President seems to be making sure that the distrusted State Department would not, on its own, condemn Yahya for killing Bengalis" (Bass). President Nixon ultimately spoke for the whole of America in his own personal refusal to acknowledge the Bangladesh Genocide. Additionally, on December 16 of 2002, the George

Washington University's National Security Archives published a collection of declassified documents, these documents show that US officials working in diplomatic institutions within Bangladesh used the terms 'selective genocide' and 'genocide' to describe events they had knowledge of at the time. The documents also show that President Nixon, advised by Henry Kissinger, decided to downplay the atrocities that were occurring, because he wanted to protect the interests of Pakistan as he was apprehensive of India's friendship with the USSR, and he was seeking a closer relationship with China, who supported Pakistan.

The Big Five have the most power in the United Nations (Security Council specifically), but they have continuously failed to apply their power where most necessary. China was supporting Pakistan, a country committing mass genocide, Russia was on the fringes of these events with an odd relationship with India, France and the UK were conveniently absent during these turn of events, and the United States also turned a blind eye to

these acts and subsequently allowed these events to occur and did not punish the oppressors for their heinous crimes. Furthermore, the United Nations refusal to acknowledge genocide in any form perpetrates the threat of superiority and allowance of these righteous acts to occur again. With the United Nations turning a blind eye and staying silent, there is an immediate threat and assumption that future situations like the holocaust, like Bangladesh, can and will occur again.

Reevaluation of the United Nations and redistribution of power is necessary in order to prevent future genocides and genocidal acts from occurring. The United Nation does have The Office on Genocide Prevention and the Responsibility to Protect, which “works to strengthen the role of the United Nations in preventing genocide, war crimes, ethnic cleansing and crimes against humanity by collecting and assessing information on situations of concern, advocating for appropriate preventive action, and raising awareness of the causes and dynamics of genocide and related crimes

and possible courses of action” (UN News Center) and the International criminal court, which is “an intergovernmental organization and international tribunal that has jurisdiction to prosecute individuals for the international crimes of genocide, crimes against humanity, and war crimes” but, these two subcategories have not done anything to prevent genocides from actually occurring, and they have been only beneficial after a genocide has occurred.

One step of redesigning the United Nation is to give the unit more power as a general entity rather than in regards to specific nations, such as the Big 5 which include Britain, the United States of America, France, Russia, and China. Relatively, the power that the Big 5 have in the United Nation Security Council needs to be dismantled. The United Nations Security Council (UNSC) is responsible for the maintenance of international peace and security as well as accepting new members to the United Nations and approving any changes to its United Nations Charter. The unit’s powers include the establishment of

peacekeeping operations, the establishment of international sanctions, and the authorization of military action through Security Council resolutions. Like the entirety of the United Nations, the Security Council was created following WWII to address the failure of the League of Nations in maintaining world peace. The Security Council consists of fifteen members, the five permanent ones stated previously and ten others that rotate every two years; additionally, the Big 5 have the power to veto any substantive Security Council resolution.

Security Council resolutions are typically enforced by UN peacekeepers who are military forces voluntarily provided by member states and funded independently out of the main UN budget. UN peacekeepers however have faced multiple counts of criticism. UN Peacekeepers have been accused of child rape, soliciting prostitutes, and sexual abuse during various peacekeeping missions in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (Washington Post), Haiti (BBC) , Liberia (New York Times), South Sudan (Telegraph), Burundi and Ivory Coast (BBC) Additionally,

Scientists cited UN peacekeepers from Nepal as the likely source of the 2010–13 Haiti cholera outbreak, which killed more than 8,000 Haitians following the 2010 Haiti earthquake (CNN). Besides allegations of sexual abuse and rape, peacekeepers have been under scrutiny for lack of active involvement during high times of conflict such as during the Rwandan genocide and the conflict of Kashmir between India and Pakistan. If the UN peacekeepers were better trained and regulated, their presence could have been properly put forth in Pakistan and may have prevented numerous atrocities from occurring; as they could have been very beneficial during the Holocaust and very well may have saved millions of people from dying.

By dismantling the Big 5, the UN would also create a blank and equal slate for multiple countries to be able to discuss precautions and courses of action for resolving conflicts and preventing them from occurring. For example, with equal power across the board, the Big 5 would not be able to use their veto power to ignore areas or situations of conflict, which include current genocides

taking place. Russia would not have been able to veto a “draft resolution seeking to set up an international criminal tribunal into the MH17 air disaster in Ukraine” (UN) as they did on July 29, of 2015. Nor would “China and Russia [be able to veto] a resolution condemning the state of Syria” (UN) as they had both done on May 22 of 2014; which ultimately gave Syria the ‘okay’ to continue their slaughtering of innocent Syrians. Without the veto power, the Big 5 would not have been able to veto against condemning illegal Israeli occupation and mass killings, as the United States did on February 18 of 2011, when they vetoed a “draft resolution condemning Israeli settlements in the West Bank” (UN). Because of these veto powers, prominent nations can and do openly ignore and sneer upon high violent crimes, acts of genocide, and various other war crimes. The Big 5, who themselves are guilty of acts of terrorism, reign supreme over the UN and have an unjust amount of superiority and power.

Reevaluation of the UN, alongside the redistribution of power, can prevent genocides from

occurring in the future. Additionally, if the UN was more organized and did not have a clear branch of power regarding nations such as the United States, Britain, Russia, France, and China, recognition of various genocides and war crimes would be more efficient and less chaotic. If a proper system was established, for example say after the Armenian Genocide, multiple casualties and acts of supremacy could have been prevented. If the UN was stricter, did not have a power struggle of conniving and power hungry leaders, and was more specific in their direction of recognizing genocide, events like the Holocaust or the Bangladesh Genocide could have been prevented, or at the very least been stopped in the beginning.

Works Cited

- Alston, Margaret. *Women and Climate Change in Bangladesh*. 2015. Print.
- BBC NEWS | Americas | UN Troops Face Child Abuse Claims." BBC News. BBC, 2006. Web. 19 Apr. 2016.
- "Peacekeepers 'abusing Children'" BBC News. BBC, 27 May 2008. Web. 19 Apr. 2016.
- Bass, Gary. "Looking Away from Genocide." *The New Yorker*. 2013. Web. 19 Apr. 2016.
- Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (CPPCG)
- Hewitt, William. *Defining the Horrific: Readings on Genocide and Holocaust in the 20th Century*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Education, 2004. Print.
- Kate Holt in Juba and Sarah Hughes. "UN Staff Accused of Raping Children in Sudan." *The Telegraph*. Telegraph Media Group, 2 Jan. 2007. Web. 19 Apr. 2016.

- Lynch, Colum. "U.N. Sexual Abuse Alleged in Congo." Washington Post. The Washington Post, 16 Dec. 2004. Web. 19 Apr. 2016.
- "Aid Workers in Liberia Accused of Sex Abuse." New York Times. New York Times, 8 May 2006. Web. 19 Apr. 2016.
- Rummel, R. J. Death by Government. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction, 1994. Print.
- Sharlach, Lisa. "Rape as Genocide: Bangladesh, the Former Yugoslavia, and Rwanda." New Political Science 22.1 (2000): 89-102. Routledge. Web. 18 Apr. 2016.
- "New Postings." The National Security Archive. Web. 19 Apr. 2016.
- "Office of The Special Adviser on The Prevention of Genocide." UN News Center. UN. Web. 19 Apr. 2016.
- "Dag Hammarskjöld Library Research Guides." Vetoes. Web. 20 Apr. 2016.
- Watson, Ivan, and Joe Vaccarello. CNN. Cable News Network, 10 Oct. 2013. Web. 20 Apr. 2016.



Keys (2016) by Puhong Li

2016-2017 Essay Contest: Thinking about Education

For this year essay contest, students were encouraged to read the following story of a Native American child who went to Carlisle Indian School in Pennsylvania from 1883 and 1890. The story reads as follows:

When I was about thirteen years old I went down to St. Michael's Catholic School. Other boys were joining the societies and spending their time in the kivas [sacred ceremonial chambers] being purified and learning secrets. But I want to learn the white man's secrets. I thought he had better magic than the Indian... So I drifted a little away from the pueblo life.

At the first snow one winter... a white man-what you call an Indian Agent- came and took all of us who were in that school far off on a train to a new kind of village called Carlisle Indian School. Seven years I was there. I set little letters together in the printing shop and we printed papers. For the rest we had lessons. There

were games, but I was too slight for foot and hand plays, and there were no horses to ride. The teachers were very solemn and made a great fuss if we did not get the puzzles right.

They told us that the Indian ways were bad. They said we must get civilized. I remember that word too. It means "be like the white man." I am willing to be like the white man, but I do not believe Indians ways were wrong. But they kept teaching us for seven years. And the books told us how bad the Indians had been to the white men. We all wore white man's clothes and ate white man's food and went to white man's churches and spoke white man's talk. And so after a while we also began to say Indians were bad. We laughed at our own people and their blankets and cooking pots and sacred societies and dances. I tried to learn the lessons- and after seven years I came home.

I went home with my family. And the next morning the governor of the pueblo and two war chiefs and many of the priest chiefs come into my father's house.

They did not talk to me; they did not even look at me. When they were all assembled they talked to my father. The chiefs said to my father, "your son who calls himself Rafael has lived with the white man. He has been far away from the pueblo. He has not lived in the kiva nor learned the things that Indian boys should learn. He has no hair. He has not blankets. He cannot even speak our language and he has a strange smell. He is not one of us"

The chiefs got up and walked out. My father was very sad. I wanted him to be angry, but he was only sad. So I would not be sad and was very angry instead. And I walked out of my father's house and out of the pueblo. I did not speak. My mother was in the other room cooking. She stayed in the other room but she made much noise rattling her pots. Some children were on the plaza and they stared at me, keeping very still as I walked away.

[After leaving the pueblo, Rafael lived as a white man working as a printer, a blacksmith and farmer in the Midwest. Years later he returned to the pueblo area]

I built a house just outside the pueblo. I would not live in the pueblo so I built outside a house bigger than the pueblo houses all for myself. My father brought me a girl to marry. Her name was Roberta. Her Indian name was P'ah-tah-zhuli (little deer bean). She was a good girl and she came to live with me in my new house outside the pueblo. When we were married I became an Indian again. I let my hair grow, I put on blankets, and I cut the seat out of my pants.

To read a longer version of this story, please consult: "A Native American tries to walk the White Man's Road (1890)" Kennedy, David & Bailey, *The American Spirit, Volume II since 1865*, 12th Edition. Wadsworth Cengage Learning, Boston Massachusetts, 2010. pp. 137-138.

Based on this story, participants were encouraged to address two questions: What should it be the purpose of education? Did Raphael (main character) receive a good education? Here you can read the award winning essays.

Fernando Faura

The scale of education requires imbalance before proper balance occurs. Embrace mistakes and display no grievances towards them, for fallacies signify an attempt, and with one comes experience followed by understanding. In "Native American Tries to Walk a White Man's Road," Raphael, a Native American, ventures on a didactic path, beginning with rudimentary principals and ending with a developed realization, conditioned by education. Education emphasizes the evolution of understanding; its purpose, to encompass the five subdivisions of understanding: Apparent understanding, Perspective, Clarity, Accommodation and Absolute understanding.

The current of understanding circulates through the mind and soul, as air does the body (lungs); it transmits through two outlets: institutional education and spiritual education. The former consists of the various hierarchies of schooling, where an instructor reflects a curriculum to the student in their own manner and serves

as the foundation for learning; its qualities constitutes gearing towards the majority vs. the minority, learning process ceases when schooling ends and focuses on specific subject matter, such as English and math. The ladder consists of one's trials and tribulations, as an inimitable curriculum bypasses the middle man and embodies the framework of life; contrary to institutional education, it provides a unique experience to each person, its process remains continuous throughout life and focuses on one's mettle.

Apparent understanding begins with a misconceived notion or a false paradigm. Institutional education: a 3rd grade student unacquainted with the math problem $\frac{1}{4} + \frac{3}{3}$ assesses it differently than one with Absolute understanding, misbelieving the line separating the numerator and denominator unite them accordingly and by adding across their conclusion incorrectly sums to $\frac{4}{7}$. Spiritual education: living through an assumption accumulates due to past life experiences. The hardships that Raphael encountered, as

an Indian, divided the Native Americans and Caucasians in terms of value, which shaped his ideology to assume “the white man... had better magic than the Indian.” But with Apparent understanding, both of these assumptions are not crystallized but fluid thoughts and when subjected to diverse interpretation, take the appropriate form.

Perspective entails comparing assumptions with actuality. Institutional education: the teacher provides structure and exposition for the student, beginning with stating that the fractions differ in terms of classification and cannot simply be added across until a relation is shared, a common denominator; they display the steps gradually, starting with finding the common denominator (12), incorporating it into the fractions ($1/4$ converts to $3/12$ and $3/3$ converts to $12/12$), adding $3/12$ and $12/12$ then simplifying $15/12$, until finally arriving at $5/4$. Spiritual education: the individual acquires insight through investigation, adaptation, and comparison. Following leaving his village for Carlisle Indian School, Raphael immersed into the ethos of “the white man,”

whether it was schooling, clothes, food, language, or thought, but noting the false concepts that they presumed of Native Americans. Seven years later, he returned to his village “a white man” and the natives ostracized him, due to opinions quartered in contrast. However, different perspectives hone logical thoughts, but like the dispersion of light by a prism, it first requires transparency.

Clarity involves the analyzation of variables that ultimately lead to an inference. Institutional education: The instructor reiterates the steps to the problem $1/4 + 3/3$ before proceeding with $5/4$, to augment the student’s comprehension, and extinguish any inquiries that may have arisen along the way, however, if discrepancies still arise, the teacher may present other methods to solve the problem, if possible. After the student documents the method that adapts to them, the teacher continues onward and informs the student that $5/4$ classifies as an improper fraction; it requires equilibrium, just as water configures to the bottom when poured into vegetable oil. With further elaboration, dividing the numerator by the

denominator, the solution amounts to $1 \frac{1}{4}$. Spiritual education: an examination of the different lifestyles leads to clarification followed by realization through commitment and perseverance. Despite the response from the natives, Raphael further submerges into the life of "the white man" by residing far from the pueblo and adopting numerous jobs, to establish clearness. But he realizes that while this lifestyle may have a source of income, it did not supplement his notion; directing him to perceive: "I was not happy." With the results, one either continues in the same direction with intent or changes course with confidence.

The utilization of the knowledge acquired and exercised is accommodation; it reinforces or revises previous ideologies, with reason attributed to experience. Institutional education: integrating the lessons and guidance of the teacher, the students attempts to solve the problem themselves, employing the method of problem-solving that best suits them. They may first rely on their notes or further support from the instructor, but with

enough repetition, they solve it without the assistance of any kind. Spiritual education: after weighing the outcomes, Raphael changes the proportion of his choice which causes stability. Previously misguided, he ceases from “the white man” régime and proceeds to move just outside the pueblo, marries an Indian named Roberta (P’ah-tah-zhuli/ little deer bean) and reverts to live like an Indian. Following the adjustment, a final assessment is reached.

The last stage is Absolute understanding; the outcome gives rise to the acceptance of thought, with a new outlook. Institutional education: the student no longer interprets the problem as they did previously. They view the fractions as distinct classes, not to be simply added, and acknowledge the steps taken to find a common denominator and to simplify an improper fraction. The student’s comprehension qualifies them to teach others as well. Spiritual education: the developmental changes attribute to a realization. Observing life as “the white man” allowed Raphael to

witness that one's fortune does not depend on their race or lifestyle, it comes from the acceptance of one's self. And while he may have tried to live through another person's shoes, the path that he walked would eventually steer him to his own. "I became an Indian again. I let my hair grow, I put on blankets, and I cut the seat out of my pants," said Raphael, as his journey led to self-actualization through spiritual education.

Raphael received a good education, for it involved both institutional education and spiritual education; however, the latter subjugated the former. A great education requires balance, as human beings are designated to the median, such as with nature and nurture, past and future, and birth and death. The math teacher that instructed Raphael lacked the ability to connect the subject with the student, which resulted in his incomprehension of fractions. Teachers symbolize the bridge to education, but the connection hinges on their purpose; it should not be the notion to reach the majority but to reach everyone. The classroom represents an area

where learning occurs, but it is not restricted to the student, it is reciprocal. Teachers who educate themselves on their students will induce education among their students, as a school is merely an institution, a body of brick and steel, but the teachers epitomize its soul.

Education begets experience and experience begets understanding. The chain that serves as a conduit of discernment; a path not devoid of footprints. And every route varies and each destination is divergent. But the journey exceeds the journey's end, as education derives from the former. Allowing one's principles to evolve from "the white man" to the right man.

Han Le

The world never stops changing: high technologies such as mobile phones are upgraded gradually every year, or cars nowadays are totally different compared to the cars of 100 years ago; but education has been the same for centuries. Everyone knows the meaning of education, but there is no explicit clue to define the purpose of education. What should it be the determination of education? This is a question which has thousands of different answers depending on the variety of people's perspectives. There is no rule to evaluate whether they are right or wrong. "A Native American Tries to Walk the White Man's Road (1890s)" supports and triggers learners' willingness on their ways to become morally educated people to reach the goals of their lives.

To be educated does not mean that the learners have to gain knowledge in every single field such as history, biology or math, but they need to learn how to think critically. Critical thinking can be practiced through answering questions after reading an article, an academic

reading or simply as solving a math problem. Instructors need to guide the learners how to solve the problems, but they should not ask their students to memorize steps on how to do it without practicing. Otherwise, they never know how to deal with these problems by themselves in math as well as in their lives. For example, the Indian man in the story mentioned that he was taught a lot of arithmetic such as immoral fractions or Greatest Common Denominators when he attended the Carlisle Indian School, but he never knew what they meant. Is this what purpose of education supposing to be? The answer is no. Moreover, "The teachers were very solemn and made a great fuss if the students did not get the puzzles right." As instructors, the teachers are not supposed to be angry or too emotional every time their students get things wrong in class. On the other hand, they need to sit down and carefully think again if the way they teach helps their students understand the lessons accurately; if not, they should think about what they should do to improve the situation instead of making their students get nervous

whenever they are questioned in class. Therefore, critical thinking is an essential skill which the learners need to have in order to recognize the differences between to be taught and to learn the lessons.

To apply successfully what learners have learned in school in their real lives is considered as one of the important goals of education in any era. Gaining a ton of theory does not seem to help any learner to make a good living. Learners need to learn what is useful for them that they can use it properly in their later lives. Otherwise, lessons they have learned become useless, and learners would forget these lessons right after they stop studying. According to the story "A Native American Tries to Walk the White Man's Road", could the Indian man be able to use all of the knowledge he has learned in school for his job? The answer is no. After spending seven years in school, he worked in a printing shop; and seven years is not required to learn how to print. The job is not worth that many years he spent on studying. Then, he ended up with a job on farms which did not apply to what he

learned from school for 7 years except for the English language. It comes to the question of what the ultimate ambition of going to school is.

Furthermore, education is not to force its learners to follow any believe in religion or races due to the issue of racism, but it supposes to respect learners' culture. In other words, education has an important role in helping people find who they are or who they want to become. People's minds are unique, so people have different points of view and different creativities as well as particular strong skills. For example, a president would have an excellent skill in presenting in front of a million people better than a technician, but a president is not as clever as a technician in working with technology. Therefore, it is unreasonable to keep every single person in a school, turn them into the kinds of people that they are not desired to be by making them forget who they are and where they come from like the education system of the Carlisle Indian School in 1890s. The Carlisle education keeps telling its Native American students how bad the Indian is by

“burning their towns and killing their women and children”, so they begin to forget their own culture and ancestor. School is supposed to be an environment where allows its learner to develop based on their unique strengths and cultural beliefs.

Also, the purpose of education should give students a chance to practice questioning skill and to be willing to bring out their own opinions. Not everything people see and hear in this diverse world is true. Successful people are the ones who know whether they should believe or not in what they are told, and if there is anything wrong, they would fight against it for their own perspective. The Carlisle education system did not give its students abilities to question or to say out loud their opinions about what they were taught. For instance, even though Raphael did not believe “Indian ways were wrong” and he had seen white men burnt Indian’s towns and killed Indian women and children, he was unable to tell the truth. This educational malpractice makes school become likely a factory which produces robots that have

the same functions instead of experts who are trained with their own talents.

Another goal of education is to let the learners know why it is important to have a good morality beside excellent academic skills. People do not only get education in schools, but they are also educated at their homes and in their countries. They learn from their parents, ancestor or neighborhoods what makes a good person different from a bad one and what moral principle they decide to lead their lives with. Because intelligence or great performing in particular area such as business, science or art is not enough to become productive citizens in an advanced industrial society. The Indian man in the story would be able to live a life of a white man with a good paying job in the white man's town because he "wore white's man clothes, ate white man's food, went to white man's churches and spoke white man's talk", yet he still decided to come back to his hometown. He wanted to live closed to his family in his pueblo where he was born and belonged to, and to be grateful to his beloved father who

was willing for him to go to school for 7 years even though his father knew that he would give up in school soon. Therefore, education is supposed to improve learners with better morality rather than making them forget who they are and changing their own personalities.

In conclusion, the story about the educational progress of an Indian man and his lifetime earnings from his education reflect why education should be the purpose of giving learners abilities to become who they want to be, and freely develop all of their own talents in order to chase their dreams and achieve their goals by supporting them in their fundamental needs. Nevertheless, education would waste learners' time while they would not gain anything from education. If the Indian man in the story got an education in respect of his culture, he would have a better life doing the job which allows him to apply his gaining knowledge from seven- years studying. By following up the developmental flow of society, people sometimes forget what purpose of an education means to their lives. Similar to the evolution of mobile phones or

cars, education needs to be upgraded to become a solid foundation for students who may be a small proportion of all population, but they are the whole future of our society.

Katsiaryna Sikorskaya

The purpose of education cannot be limited to one and must evolve throughout time to best fit the needs of society or any individual in question. In essence, education is a powerful liberating tool which stores the capacity to either build or destroy and can take on so many shades and meanings depending on a historical era of ones existence. A very prominent one was the Era of the European settlement of America which is precipitated by ethnocentrism where the white men think that their ideas, beliefs and practices are superior to the Native American ones. This fact began to reflect on the education they provided or the act of becoming civilized as they tried to instill in Native American minds early on. Undoubtedly, cultural conflict did exist during this time period undermining the purpose of education by using cultural imposition as its means.

From the early human existence to the dawn of civilizations education has played various roles. But what has definitely remained the same throughout the ages is

the notion that education is the epitome of knowledge. At first, the knowledge was passed on to individuals and used as means of survival in harsh environments, later, it was applied for the good of all not just for individual purposes when societies arose and developed the need for improvement. It is at this time that knowledge was deemed necessary to interact within that community enhancing its conditions.

Walking down memory lane of various historic events, it gets harder to ignore that culture seems to influence the individual views on education the most. For instance, the Indian collectivist culture treats education as means of preparation for mature life, where the role of education is that of social acceptance, it has a cohort effect in which education must be achieved at a certain age. The white man's individualistic culture is different in this respect, one is never too old to learn and the education is considered "permanent." Which is the case with Raphael, our main hero, who took a different path where education is not a mere preparation for life, education is life itself.

And if one figures out the purpose of life he will definitely be able to figure out what should be the purpose of education as well. As a result, the main character just happens to learn that it is important to form a positive ethnic identity. And if you are constantly being discriminated and told that the ethnic identity you belong to is bad like Raphael was, then it would complicate their efforts to develop a sense of cultural belonging and a set of personally meaningful goals. Doing so will not be helpful in attaining happiness, which the main character came to realize after he had married and turned back to his Indian ways. In "A Native American Tries to Walk the White Man's Road" the Holy Grail of Raphael was "the white man's secrets" -what one might call education. Even though his tribe also possessed the secrets to be learnt by going to kiva, special places of receiving knowledge, he considered that different is better somehow when he stated: "I thought that he (the white man) had better magic than the Indian." But as we come to learn at the end of this story different doesn't always mean better. As a result of

acquiring the knowledge of the white men Raphael was rejected by his society merely because he differed in the kind of knowledge that he possessed or lacked and had a different outward appearance. This leads us to believe that what fits the bill for one person doesn't necessarily mean that it will be as good for someone else. Besides getting rejected by his tribe, the kind of indoor work that Raphael performed had affected his health as well. On the whole, he wasn't quite happy by obtaining the Holy Grail that he longed for since early childhood. On one hand, Raphael received good education, he had learned the English language and was prepared to enter the workforce working in a printing shop and function in the white man's society. On the other hand, the education he had received did have some flaws, for instance, Raphael mentioned that he never knew what the Greatest Common Denominator meant, he would just guess and always get the wrong answer. Also if we compare the time that Raphael lived and received his education to the modern times we would find that the process of

acculturation took place throughout the whole period. The only difference is cultural assimilation nowadays is a naturally occurring process whereas in Raphael's time it was reinforced by negative effects of ridiculing an Indian culture or making accusations against Indian people and trying to turn their own people against them by engraving in younger generations' minds that being Indian is bad and masquerading this process as something innocent as providing education which caused them to jump on the bandwagon of white supremacy ideology. With this in mind, education that was provided with any hidden agenda is not considered to be good after all. I'm going to provide the reader with the similitude of being given a gift that is unwanted or not needed. It is still a gift only not the one that you can use, for instance, you were given a boat but there's absolutely no source of water around and no way of using it. Same with Raphael, he did receive education only not the one applicable in Indian society at that time.

Indeed, everyone has heard the expression which states that not everyone fits the mold. It is true in terms of figuring out a purpose of education in individualistic vs collectivist societies. The purpose of education in individualist societies is different from what it is in collectivist cultures. Raphael was raised in an individualistic society of white people where education not only intended to improve the holder's economic self worth but also improve his/her self respect. The main character mentions that he made a good living and built a house bigger than the pueblo houses all for himself just outside the pueblo. This definitely speaks volumes in terms of self-realization. As mentioned above, in collectivist (group-oriented) cultures, the role of education is that of social acceptance, which is the case in Indian culture. Thus, the Indian chiefs declared that just because of different education that Raphael had received, a different appearance and a strange odor he was not considered to be one of them, i.e. *persona non grata*. In simpler terms, the purpose of education cannot be applied

as one size fits all. So what should be the purpose of education, you may ask. Well, first of all, it doesn't have to be one purpose, and definitely it doesn't have to be either or. There could be multiple purposes that are not limited in scope and can be integrated into a society to fit a variety of educational needs in a given time period. Second, education doesn't have to take place just at a certain time like when you attend school, it should be more than that, encompassing all dimensions of human experience by taking place from cradle to the grave. After all, our main character still continued to learn valuable life lessons long after completing the formal education. He attended the school of life, the informal education one receives by learning from one's experiences, both good and bad. To conclude, a proper education is indeed important, but one should not neglect the lessons he/she receives from the school of life.

Thinking about education leads me to believe that its ultimate purpose should be the one that would give a new lease on life. Education should provide anyone with

an opportunity to be successful and happy. It should enable one to do well in whatever walk of life he or she may choose. Raphael was able to achieve all that except for happiness. His happiness was still incomplete without his ethnic identity. He got on the way of attaining the happiness after he began to connect with his ethnic identity truly. He showed us through his example, that variety is the spice of life and by trying different kinds of experiences and gaining sometimes different knowledge we'll eventually find the one that would lead us to happiness.



Gravity (2017) by Seyma Dereli

Notable Papers of the Academic Year 2016-2017

This paper was written for His 121: History of Western Civilization I taught by Professor Marc Lane.

The Moorish Influence in Medieval Christian Iberia

Noah Freire

Modern Iberia, or Portugal and Spain, is known not for its Moorish identity but for its Christian history and its South-Western European heritage. At one point in Iberia's history, Christianity was no longer the dominant religion in the peninsula but a backdrop to the invading people known as the "Moors."²⁴ The term "moor" is derived from the Latin word *maurus*, meaning someone from Mauritania, a region in North Africa. Iberia was made up largely of Visigoth, Vandal, and Roman stock with minor Celtic raids in the north of the region of Galicia. These tribes traded, fought, and lived with each other for centuries and were united under one common similarity: their Christian identity. This uniting principle was enough

²⁴ R. A. Fletcher, *Reconquest and Crusade in Spain*, (1987) Cambridge University Press., 31-47.

to hold Iberia together when the invading moors crossed the Mediterranean from Northern Africa into South-Western Europe and attempted to expand their reach of territorial acquisition. The pure and unfettered religious spirit preserved in Northern Iberia motivated a Reconquest of the peninsula from the forces of the "other". As R. A. Fletcher notes, "Spain suffered for Christendom".²⁵ Islam posed a threat to the Christian kings and people of the area allowing imminent wars to soon follow. The *Reconquista* of Moorish Iberia was more than just a religious divide, it was an ideological, cultural, and spiritual rift which brought to account the extent that people will go to preserve history.

Several reasons account for the acquisition of most of the Iberian Peninsula in the early Eighth Century by the moors. A large portion of this was due to the decadence of the Visigoth regime that was overthrown by the invaders due to its lack of preparedness. This switch of power served as an impetus for the Christians of the north to

²⁵ Ibid.,

view the ordeal as it being their 'destiny' for "reconquering the land of Spain from the Moors."²⁶ Despite the semblance of divide, many Christian kings reconciled with invading Muslim rulers and assisted one another with military aid. This is evidenced in the death of King Ramiro I of Asturias in 1063 by a force comprised of Christian Castilians and Muslim Zaragozans.²⁷ An increase in cooperation among the two forces, however, created a need for tribute-taking which sapped the vitality of the Muslim prince's preparation to a Christian takeover of their lands. Fletcher contends, "a shift in the terms of Christian-Muslim relations was taking place."²⁸ Restraint on both sides of the religious divide faded and what was left was marked by more aggressive attitudes. The idea of divinity and the righteousness of war played a role in the battles that would soon follow. This is evidenced by king

²⁶ R. A. Fletcher, *Reconquest and Crusade in Spain*, (1987) Cambridge University Press., 31-47.

²⁷ *Ibid.*,

²⁸ *Ibid.*,

of Portugal, Afonso Henriques, saying that he owed the conquest of the Portuguese city of Santarem to God.²⁹

An acclaimed instance or *narratio* of individual conquests is written by King Alfonso VI of Leon and Castile delineating land privileges to the cathedral church of Toledo issued in December 1086. Alfonso mentions the following in his account: "I took up arms against the barbarian peoples...I Alfonso the emperor under the leadership of Christ might restore to the worshippers of the same faith..."³⁰ It was this belief that Alfonso was carrying out God's holy task through battle that fueled the reconquest and was in a sense a "pre-Crusade crusade." Internal division in Iberia eventually spread to the land of Portugal as King Fernando I of Castile and Leon attacked the Portuguese town of Viseu in 1055 with the purpose of avenging the death of his father-in-law who was killed while besieging it.³¹ It was this very drive for power and

²⁹ Ibid.,

³⁰ R. A. Fletcher, *Reconquest and Crusade in Spain*, (1987) Cambridge University Press., 31-47.

³¹ Ibid.,

revenge that led to the transition from the “muddled international raid” of the First Crusade to the broadened approach of the Second Crusade in the years 1146-49 to include the Baltic and the Iberian peninsula as well as portions of the Middle East. R. A. Fletcher makes note that “we are invited to consider that the Christian expansion of that period was rather a conquest than a reconquest, and that it was propelled by more earthly impulses than earlier and more fastidious scholars choose to contemplate”.³² Relations would never be the same in the Spanish kingdoms and in Portugal as time would serve to tell.

Land was but one aspect of what was at stake with the transition of new people into the peninsula; culture itself was influenced as well. The *fado* is one of Portugal’s favorite songs, adored by the people of Lisbon. The *fado* is sung at cafés like the “Luso” and the “Victoria” where it is performed by *fadistas*. Rodney Gallop notes that “the true fado is always sad...its sophisticated cadences breathe a

³² Ibid.,

spirit of theatrical self-pity combined with genuine sincerity.” Its emotional character reveals the tragedy of resignation from lands, in leaving of one’s home to venture to the unknown.³³ Wives of sailors and fishermen usually sung this song as they expressed their sadness and longing for their spouses return. Some theorists suggest that the *fado* has origins in Moorish Iberia, but this has been subject to continued debate. It would seem probable, however, that some Moorish inhabitants expressed their *saudades* or longing to return home to Northern Africa from a long and unwelcomed journey in South-Western Europe. This very idea of returning home was persistent throughout the period of Moorish Iberia as fate would have it.

In the larger context, Medieval Iberia is more than mere geography, its true definition is broad and overreaching compared to its physical representation in the historical view. Traditionally, historians have used the

³³ Rodney Gallop, *The Fado (The Portuguese Song of Fate)*, (1993) Oxford University Press., 199-213.

terms “Medieval Spain” and “Hispania” to refer to the peninsula, however, this confines the period and does not take into account the holistic meaning of the Iberian people to include the Muslim and Christian realms as well as Jewish communities from about 500 to 1500 CE.³⁴ This need for wholeness and accuracy is present when Alfonso VII, king of Castille, dubbed himself “the ruler of the three religions Christianity, Judaism, and Islam, suggesting his desire to encompass the varied peoples of his realms”.³⁵ Some historians view Alfonso as part of the reconquest to regain the peninsula back from the Moors who resided in the area from 711 until the fragmentation of their final kingdom in Granada in 1492.³⁶ This tumultuous reign ended with Granada’s capitulation to the Catholic monarchs Fernando and Isabel in 1492. Gaul’s border with Iberia was never absolute and between the years of 780 to 801 northeastern Iberia fell to Frankish control. Historical

³⁴ Jean Dangler, *Edging Toward Iberia*, (2006) The Johns Hopkins University Press., 12-26.

³⁵ *Ibid.*,

³⁶ *Ibid.*,

land disputes have usually never ended and this was the case when battles and skirmishes between Andalusí and Frankish troops persisted into the ninth century, and did not end in the battle of Tours or Poitiers when the Muslims were defeated. Iberia is best understood, Danger emphasizes, as a “theoretical concept that designates a space of interaction between different groups of people.”³⁷

Relations between the Christians and Muslims in Eleventh-Century Spain is one of progress but also of inborn animosity as racial tensions prevailed. Lynn Nelson, a Professor of Medieval History at the University of Kansas reasons that “Europe had entered a new era of opportunity and growth,” in the opening of the eleventh century.³⁸ In Spain, this century was marked by a strange union of Christian and Muslim lands in a system of tribute and production known as *parias*. This system served to distinguish the Christian Spanish from their European

³⁷ Jean Dangler, *Edging Toward Iberia*, (2006) The Johns Hopkins University Press., 12-26.

³⁸ Lynn H. Nelson, *Christian-Muslim Relations in Eleventh-Century Spain*, (1979) The University of Kansas., 195-198.

neighbors residing in the Iberian Peninsula. Alternations in the balance of military and political power of the Peninsula can be seen in the continuation of dominance of the unified Muslim Caliphate of Cordoba over the fragile and disunited Christian states of Northern Iberia. Factional strife, tribal rivalries, theological controversies and economic envy all contributed to civil strife within the caliphate.³⁹ Muslim military forces in Spain proved to be unreliable and foreign mercenaries comprises the standing army of the caliphate. This proved to be fatal for the Muslim army since basing the power of the state upon a mercenary army destroyed any basis for civil responsibility. The caliphate soon crumbled as political fragmentation was encouraged to a level where about fifty small states or kingdoms were formed. Part of the disintegration was due to the Moor's heavy reliance on Christian military power, and the need for keeping a semblance of civil solidarity in the form of taxes as

³⁹ Ibid.,

opposed to personal initiative.⁴⁰ In retrospect, the Christians were the winners in this scenario and the Spanish Romanesque traditions arose under widespread patronage.

The image of the Moor in Medieval Portugal served as an impetus for conflict in Iberia as racial tensions took hold. For medieval Portugal, "Africa was familiar and strange... an unknown expanse of land that glimmered black under the equatorial sun," notes Josiah Blackmore.⁴¹ For Portugal, like Spain, Africa was in the demographics and history of Iberian culture represented in the figure of the Moor, who were viewed as "others."⁴² Blackmore references Jeffrey J. Cohen who contends that the Saracen, one of the medieval terms for moor, "whose dark skin and diabolical physiognomy were the western Middle Ages' most familiar, most exorbitant embodiment of racial

⁴⁰ Ibid.,

⁴¹ Josiah Blackmore, *Imagining the Moor in Medieval Portugal*, (2006) The Johns Hopkins University Press., 27-43.

⁴² Ibid.,

alterity"⁴³. It was this very sense of racial unfamiliarity that served as a dividing point that separated European Portuguese and Spanish from the Medieval moor. Representations of the "self/other" binary permeated early scholarly work on Europeans and their foreign inhabitants, notably in the context of imperial/colonial studies or in the examination of the conflictive representations of Moors and Europeans in medieval epics.⁴⁴ This idea of "race" must be considered of the African as perceived and written about by Portuguese and the non-Christian status of Africans lead to an idea of convertibility. In the Iberian Middle Ages, the Portuguese *mouro* and Castilian *moro* are both derived from the Latin *maurus*, both terms used to refer to the Moors or people from Mauritania in North Africa. Geography played a role in the inclusion of a racial component as the Mediterranean separated the South-Western Europeans from the North Africa Moors. The term is considerably

⁴³ Ibid.,

⁴⁴ Ibid.,

vague in the sense that the historical authenticity of the *moro* and its application is ambiguous.⁴⁵

Portuguese history itself can serve as an explanation to the rather factitious relations between Moors and Christian Europeans in Iberia. Joao de Bianchi writes that “the Portuguese belong to the Latin family of the Indo-European branch of the white race.”⁴⁶ For the most part, they descend from the Lusitanians, one of the Celt-Iberos tribes that inhabited the Iberian Peninsula.⁴⁷ Lusitania was limited in the south by the Tagus, and by the ridge of the Herminios in the east, now the *Serra da Estrela* or mountain of stars. The Romans dominated the peninsula as a few years before the birth of Christ, Caius Julius Caesar became the Roman praetor of Lusitania. Despite being the westernmost part of Europe, Portugal could not escape the fourth-century invasions by several Vandal tribes who were ousted by the Visigoths. This

⁴⁵ Josiah Blackmore, *Imagining the Moor in Medieval Portugal*, (2006) The Johns Hopkins University Press., 27-43.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*,

⁴⁷ Joao de Bianchi, *Portugal Celebrates Eight Centuries of Existence, 1140-1940*, (1940) Duke University Press., 336-341.

group of people, the Visigoths, remained in the Iberian Peninsula for over two centuries, founded monarchies, promoted Christianity, and introduced aspects of law to local life.⁴⁸ In the Eight Century, Bianchi notes, came the Muslim invasions of the Arabs and Moors. Racial tensions in Iberia were so powerful that resentment lead to war which lasted centuries. Christian knights in the early twelfth century crossed over the French mountainous region of the Pyrenees to fight the moors, among them a grandson of Robert, king of France, Bianchi notes. Robert was awarded and won “the hand of the daughter of the king of Leon and was made Count of Portocale, a small locality on the estuary of the Douro River”.⁴⁹ Affonso Henriques, Robert’s son, proclaimed the independence of Portocale in 1128 and its adjoining lands; he was Portugal’s first king.

Henriques’ rise to power in Medieval Portugal was marked by battles against the Moors. In 1139 he defeated

⁴⁸ Ibid.,

⁴⁹ Joao de Bianchi, *Portugal Celebrates Eight Centuries of Existence, 1140-1940*, (1940) Duke University Press., 336-341.

five Moorish kings at Ourique and in 1140 defeated the Castillans; this date is considered Portugal's national organization. Subsequent kings struggled to hold Portugal's independence from the kingdoms of Leon, Castile, and Aragon and to drive away the Moors to protect the frontier of the new realm. Portugal's first university, now located at Coimbra, was founded in 1290. During this time, the land obtained recognition by the Holy See in exchange for her deeds in expanding the Christian faith.⁵⁰ During this period the Kingdom of Portugal displayed its loyalty to Christianity which went at odds with the Medieval Moorish ideology. The Spanish and the Portuguese also had an unstable relationship for a good portion of early Iberian history as the phrase "*De Espanha nem bom vento, nem bom casamento*" ("From Spain comes neither good wind nor good marriage") implies, relations in the peninsula were not pleasant.⁵¹ The unified Portuguese met the Roman legions and resisted long and

⁵⁰ Ibid.,

⁵¹ Emily Ericsson, Little Land, (1950) American Association for the Advancement of Science., 15-23.

stubbornly. Roman victories in the region lead to the land of Portugal being called *Lusitania*, which remained an important part of the Roman empire for five centuries. Prior to the twelfth century the area that is now Portugal was called *Portucalis* and Henri de Bourgogne was its first attempted ruler in 1107 and named first Count of Portugal by Alfonse of Castille, his father in law. ⁵²

Population in the land of Portugal was originally of Iberian and Celtic stock, and these characteristics can still be seen in certain regions of the country. Emily Ericsson of the University of Kansas and Southwestern College and Embassy of the United States at Lisbon contends that the inhabitants of Portugal are “descendants of the Visigoths, Vandals, Alans, and Suevi who overran Lusitania during the Roman occupation.”⁵³ However, modern Portuguese show an admixture of different bloods, specifically the Moorish. Ericsson notes that “although the Moors held Lusitania in military subjection and not as a unified

⁵² Ibid.,

⁵³ Emily Ericsson, Little Land, (1950) American Association for the Advancement of Science., 15-23.

nation, their imprint is unmistakable.”⁵⁴ This can be seen in architecture and art in Portugal. It is evident that, at one point, the three Abrahamic religions coexisted in the peninsula. Maria Rosa Menocal references *la realidad historica*, or a realistic history, based on all legitimate viewpoints of culture in Medieval Iberia. Menocal makes note of the *convivencia* or *reconquista*’s role in shaping how the three Abrahamic religions coexisted in the area or how they failed to do so.⁵⁵ To explore Iberian history, questions need to be asked about the extent that ideological and cultural shifts shaped life in the peninsula. Historical analysis of Iberia proves to be paradoxical in the sense that Christians, Moors, and Jews are depicted as living reasonably peaceful together, however, this is far from the truth as contentions flared and a reconquest was starting to form.⁵⁶ Christendom’s growing adherence halted any

⁵⁴ Ibid.,

⁵⁵ Maria Rosa Menocal, *Why Iberia?* (2006) The Johns Hopkins University Press., 7-11.

⁵⁶ Ibid.,

attempt at peace with the “others” of the kingdoms of Portugal and of Spain.

The kingdom of Portugal’s new relationship with the papacy during the medieval era is interpreted in several ways throughout history. Benedict Wiedemann of the Department of History at the University College London notes that in December 1143 the king of Portugal, Afonso Henriques, “confirmed in a letter to Pope Innocent II that he had performed homage, *hominium facere*, to the papacy through the papal legate, Cardinal Guido.”⁵⁷ Following Pope Innocent’s death several months before, like his successor Celestine II, the next pope Lucius II dispatched a confirmation of the letter in May 1142. Afonso was not recognized as king until 1179 by the papacy; instead, referring to him as duke of Portugal or *dux Portugalensis*.⁵⁸ Before Afonso’s alliance with the papacy, he agreed to the Treaty of Zamora with Alfonso

⁵⁷ Benedict G.E. Wiedemann, *The Kingdom of Portugal, Homage and Papal ‘Fiefdom’ in the Second Half of the Twelfth Century*, (2014) *Journal of Medieval History*., 432-445.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*,

VII of Castile-Leon in which the Castilian emperor acknowledged the royal status of Afonso. An alliance with the papacy was an attempt to display Portugal's independence from Castile-Leon. Feudalistic terms apply to this reciprocal relationship as the Kingdom of Portugal was essentially a papal fief and King Afonso was the vassal. Wiedemann references Johannes Fried's perspective saying that "the relationship more resembled one of protection than overlordship."⁵⁹ Reexamination of the connection between Portugal and the papacy can be termed feudo-vassalic. Perhaps the best-known letter from the Holy See to Portugal in the twelfth century is the *Manifestis probatum*. This gave the title of king, or *rex*, to Afonso and his successors. Of course, this came at a cost; in this case, it was two marks of gold. On 13 April 1179, a privilege was issued for the Templars describing Afonso's mother, Teresa, as "the mother of our most beloved son in Christ, the illustrious king of Portugal."⁶⁰ Relations with

⁵⁹ Ibid.,

⁶⁰ Ibid.,

the papacy increased Portugal's loyalty to Christendom which was disagreed with the framework of Moorish perceptions.

Moorish rule of Spain lasted for almost eight centuries, a period marked by widespread tension. Max Harris of New York University and the Massachusetts Institute of Technology notes that "the first and decisive invasion took place in 711, and by 732 Muslim forces had advances as far as Poitiers, in central France."⁶¹ A *reconquista* pushed the religious frontier back until in Fernanda and Isabel subjugated the last Moorish stronghold of Granada in 1492. Harris emphasizes that a key phase of the *reconquista* occurred in the second third of the 13th century when Jaime I of Aragon-Catalunya and Fernando III and Alfonso X of Castilla-Leon recovered parts of Moorish-controlled land in Southern Spain. The Treaty of Almirra set borders to be followed separating the growing kingdoms of Aragon-Catalunya and Castilla-

⁶¹ Max Harris, *Muhammed and the Virgin: Folk Dramatizations of Battles Between Moors and Christians in Modern Spain*, (1994) The MIT Press., 45-61.

Leon in 1244. Every year a festival known as *las fiestas de moros y cristianos* is celebrated in the towns and villages of Alicante, Valencia, and several other regions of Spain. Moorish and Christian battles are reenacted and dramatized to remember the relationship between the two. The purpose of these folk festivities is “a celebration of the historical triumph of Christianity over Islam in Spain,” Harris contends.⁶² One aspect of the feasts is the *festeros*, those who participate in the feast, speaking about the battles not in terms of victory or of secular ideas but of *convivencia*, living together with others.⁶³ The degree of difference between the two religions of Islam and Christianity and collective ideas thereof was a plague to the people of the Iberian Peninsula as wars were bound to occur. Moorish presence in Iberia can be interpreted as a struggle between the sacred and profane worlds or ideologies inhabiting the peninsula; a philosophical war of

⁶² Ibid.,

⁶³ Ibid.,

right against wrong, worthy against unworthy, just against unjust.

Military redemption and the Castilian Reconquest of 1180-1250 shed light onto matters brewing in medieval Iberian Peninsula. James Brodman of the University of Central Arkansas suggests that “the problem of captivity itself was hardly new as it dated back to the Arab conquest of Spain in the Eight Century, but it did not become serious until the twelfth.”⁶⁴ Growing Christian kingdoms brought a sense of friction to the Reconquest and strengthened feuds on both European and Moorish sides during this time in Iberian history as the Berber invaders entered the peninsula from North Africa. Ransoming was a practice used by the Spanish Christians in attempts to free other Christians in Moorish lands and merchants of municipal councils began to serve as intermediaries between Christian families and Muslim captors.⁶⁵ Even though Castilian monarch, Fernando III,

⁶⁴ James W. Brodman, *Military Redemptionism and the Castilian Reconquest, 1180-1250*, (1980) *Military Affairs.*, 24-27.

⁶⁵ *Ibid.*,

formed no hospitals of redemption, the city of Santiago's strong identification with the work of aiding Christendom allowed the forthcoming of grants. During the 1220s the great Reconquest of Fernando III was starting to push toward Andalusia and Alfonso and his wife aimed at assisting the poor when the captives no longer required redemption. The Church's attempt at liberating Christians can be seen clearly in the formation of religious redemption with the goal of freeing Christian captives.⁶⁶ Christians were at odds with the African Moorish religion of Islam inhabiting most of the Near East and Northern Africa during the Medieval era. This sense of disagreement is imbedded in the framework of Iberia, of Europe itself. Dealings with the Moorish "barbarians" was a test of not only religion, but of race.⁶⁷ Racial acceptance faced its most severe test in the period of Medieval Iberia and its Moorish occupation for generations and centuries.

⁶⁶ Ibid.,

⁶⁷ Ibid.,

Iberian society was not a linear story of identity but a process of differentiation of contrasting faiths in Ninth-Century al-Andalus or Islamic Iberia. Moorish culture “has been identified as one of crisis for the Iberian church and Christian community,” reasons Janina Safran of the University of Chicago.⁶⁸ Local churches received severe condemnations from Rome and Frankfurt for allowing Christians a large degree of interaction with Muslims and Jews. While under Muslim rule in the middle of the ninth century, Christian communities social and cultural changes has begun including acculturation by the opposing religions in the area. In Cordoba, Christians and Muslims participated in religious arguments that tested the extent of coexistence in the peninsula. Many Iberians feared contact with Islamic culture would bring “a demise of Latin-Christian culture, and contribute to the isolation of the Christian community from the rest of Christendom.”⁶⁹ Islamic influence is also seen in the

⁶⁸ Janina M. Safran, *Identity and Differentiation in Ninth-Century al-Andalus*, (2001) The University of Chicago Press., 573-598.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*,

conquered Kingdom of Valencia from 1240 to 1280. Ignatius Burns of the University of Chicago asserts that the “conquest of the Muslim Kingdom of Valencia was ‘the crown and fine flower of the Reconquest’ of eastern Spain and the most important political event in the reign of the great king of Aragon.”⁷⁰ The crusaders of Aragon fought fiercely to halt the proud and extensive realm of Valence from 1232 to 1245.⁷¹ Christian gains in land followed with grave problems, more fearsome than any experiences in physical battle. Valencia’s kingdom had a fragile Christian settlement and faced the task of being garrisoned against the conqueror’s ways.⁷² The defensive frontier of Christendom has progressed to the southernmost portion of Spain. Muslim culture’s strength and persistence was equivalent to that of the Crusaders as they faced each other in battle. The clash between these

⁷⁰ Ignatius R. Burns, *Journey from Islam: Incipient Cultural Transition in the Conquered Kingdom of Valencia (1240-1280)*, (1960) The University of Chicago Press., 337-356.

⁷¹ *Ibid.*,

⁷² *Ibid.*,

two cultures can be viewed as a replacement of the old by doctrines of the new.⁷³

As the *reconquista* waged on, an idea of conversion took place and soon swept through the Spanish Kingdoms in Iberia. The reconstruction of the Valencian Kingdom had an element of clash where a problem lied within the idea of conversion from Islam to Christianity. Burns reasons that the Moor can be viewed as “a by-product of the main dispute, a kind of displaced person, whose story and status illumine the larger scene.”⁷⁴ A growing movement that the Moor was part of had social consequences and created a sense of cultural immigration from Iberian society. It was this fragile identity in a new land, a foreign place marked with different culture, language, and customs that proved too distinct for the Moor to cope with. Attempts to convert the Muslims had been part of the Crusading movement as an atmosphere of

⁷³Ignatius R. Burns, *Journey from Islam: Incipient Cultural Transition in the Conquered Kingdom of Valencia (1240-1280)*, (1960) The University of Chicago Press., 337-356.

⁷⁴ *Ibid.*,

hatred pervaded the battlefield and the social landscape. Following the multitude of riots that pervaded the Kingdom of Valencia, by the end of King James' reign, Muslim converts to Christianity fell to blame with other Moors and were treated with contempt by the Spanish Christians. The war was still present in 1242 in the southern part of Valencia, and two decades later in 1262, King James signed into law protections of the rights of Moorish converts seeking baptism to receive it without penalty.⁷⁵ King Peter, James' successor, held a contrary view of the Saracens or Arabs inhabiting Valencia, insisting that they "presume to malign the Catholic faith and with rash impertinence to abuse the Christian neophytes."⁷⁶ Another issue was formed on the island of Majora, where conditions equaled those of King James' subjugation of Valencia, the feudal lords issued complaints to Pope Gregory IX saying that the Moors sought baptism only to avoid slavery and resumed their

⁷⁵ Ibid.,

⁷⁶ Ibid.,

lives no different than previously, angering Christians. Valencia's Moorish society could not cope with the need for Christian faith's expansion and the Europeans intolerance of its Muslim's subjects. Burn's makes note, "the swords were sheathed, the reconquest of Spain was virtually accomplished."⁷⁷

One of the greatest heroes of Spanish history during the *reconquista* was El Cid, Rodrigo Diaz. A Castilian nobleman who rose to prominence with the subjugation of the Muslim city of Valencia in 1094. The Cluniac Order helped to keep El Cid in power, despite being born into a Castilian aristocratic family in a period of dire political change in Iberia around 1043. The Islamic Umayyad Caliphates earliest collapse occurred after 1009 when it crumbled into several *taifa* city states that had "shifted the balance of power in favor of the realms of the Christian north-Leon, Castile, Navarre, Aragon and the

⁷⁷ Ignatius R. Burns, *Journey from Islam: Incipient Cultural Transition in the Conquered Kingdom of Valencia (1240-1280)*, (1960) The University of Chicago Press., 337-356.

Catalan counties..."⁷⁸ El Cid led an unauthorized raid against the Moorish land of Toledo and was exiled by the Alfonso VI. Rodrigo Diaz was essentially a representation of the dominant ideology of Christianity and its struggle to maintain Spanish cultural and religious authenticity in the Iberian Peninsula. El Cid's success on the battlefield can be attributed to the growing sentiment of the Christian frontier in Iberia as Cluniacs like Urban II, Archbishop Bernard of Toledo and Jerome of Perigord, bishop of Valencia persuading a stronger stance against the Moors.⁷⁹ One key aspect that kept the *reconquista* able to continue was the ongoing territorial bickering between the different races of Iberia. Racial tension accounts for a good portion of the feuds between Moorish Caliphates and Christian Kings during the years between 711 and 1492, from the first invasion of Spain to the capture of Granada. Iberia was a land divided politically, religiously, racially, socially, and culturally by a group of people naïve

⁷⁸ Simon Barton, *El Cid, Cluny and the Medieval Spanish Reconquista*, (2011) *English Historical Review.*, 517-543.

⁷⁹ *Ibid.*,

to the customs of the South-Western European peninsula. Many of its people longed to return home to Northern Africa and to forget the unwelcome stay that the Europeans provided for these them; however, the need for religious expansion cast a motive for the Moors to remain in Europe, hoping to spread and maintain an Islamic presence in Iberia. As history attests, religious feuds can destabilize even the most robust of civilizations like that of the Holy Roman Empire.

The Moors influence in Christian Iberia can be seen in several ways in retrospect. Poetry of the time depicted the recovery of Spain by Christendom as a religious milestone for the Spanish. John van Horne of the American Association of Teachers of Spanish and Portuguese argues that “poets regarded the invasion of the Arabs in 711 as a punishment sent by God for the sins of Rodrigo and his Gothic court.”⁸⁰ Rodrigo or Roderic being the last Visigothic king of Hispania, being killed by

⁸⁰ John van Horne, *The Moors in Epic Retrospect*, (1926) American Association of Teachers of Spanish and Portuguese., 313-324.

invading Moors. The Spanish believed that Christendom suffered by being subjected to eight centuries of rule by the Mohammedans. When the Moors captured the city of Leon, robbery, the profanation of sacred statues and architecture and the horrid treatment of women were all exposed. An instance of this is in the *cantos* or songs of *El Leon de Espana*, which told the account of the Spanish forces anger against the tribute of a hundred maidens by the Moors. Poetry was written about the idea of hubris and expansion of Islam throughout Hispania. Horne makes note that "the principal basis for Spanish hatred and contempt of the Moors is probably religious...the anger felt against intruders who had so long exercised political control over Spain."⁸¹ The theme of divinity is widespread in Iberian poetry due to the underlying believe that God was punishing the Spanish for their profane acts under Visigothic rule. One notable aspect was the Moorish defeat and losing of Granada with the Moors

⁸¹ John van Horne, *The Moors in Epic Retrospect*, (1926) American Association of Teachers of Spanish and Portuguese., 313-324.

begging the Spanish king for a longer stay for their departure. Leaving Iberia was hard for the Moors since they created a home for themselves in Europe; without being aware that the two vastly different religions could not cohabitate in a land of division.

The Moorish influence in Medieval Christian Iberia is one of cultural and religious struggle as Christendom faced its most severe test. Hispania, the region of Spain and Portugal, had been a land invaded by several tribes that shared many similarities. For the most part the Iberians were of Visigoth, Vandal, Roman, and Celtic stock. There was one common similarity that held Iberians together: their Christian identity. To the dismay of many, a new faith created discomfort and challenged the ideology of the Iberian Peninsula. The European Spanish and Portuguese were not accustomed to the Moors, which came to stand for "other." Moorish inhabitants crossed the Mediterranean Sea from Northern Africa to enter South-Western Europe with the goal of religious expansion. Racial difference paired with religious unfamiliarity

created a reason to engage in war with the African Moors. The territorial border between the Christians and the Muslims changed several times during the nearly five centuries of Moorish presence, however, it generally pushed southward as the *Reconquista* waged on. Christianity in Hispania was, in a sense, an impetus for the need to regain land that was lost to the Islamic invaders. The Reconquest of Hispania demonstrated the extent to which individuals will go to preserve culture, religion, and land in the face of an unknown threat. It was an ideological war as well as a physical one, a struggle for preservation as well as for territory, one of self-fulfillment against the need for expansion.

References

- Barton, Simon, *El Cid, Cluny and the Medieval Spanish Reconquista*, (2011) *English Historical Review.*, 517-543.
- Bianchi, Joao de, *Portugal Celebrates Eight Centuries of Existence, 1140-1940*, (1940) Duke University Press., 336-341.
- Blackmore, Josiah, *Imagining the Moor in Medieval Portugal*, (2006) The Johns Hopkins University Press., 27-43.
- Brodman, James W., *Military Redemptionism and the Castilian Reconquest, 1180-1250*, (1980) *Military Affairs.*, 24-27.
- Burns, Ignatius R., *Journey from Islam: Incipient Cultural Transition in the Conquered Kingdom of Valencia (1240-1280)*, (1960) The University of Chicago Press., 337-356.
- Dangler, Jean Dangler Edging, *Toward Iberia*, (2006) The Johns Hopkins University Press., 12-26.
- Ericsson, Emily, Little Land, (1950) *American Association for the Advancement of Science.*, 15-23.

- Fletcher, R. A. *Reconquest and Crusade in Spain*, (1987) Cambridge University Press., 31-47.
- Gallop, Rodney, *The Fado* (The Portuguese Song of Fate), (1993) Oxford University Press., 199-213.
- Harris, Max, *Muhammed and the Virgin: Folk Dramatizations of Battles Between Moors and Christians in Modern Spain*, (1994) The MIT Press., 45-61.
- Horne, John van, *The Moors in Epic Retrospect*, (1926) American Association of Teachers of Spanish and Portuguese., 313-324.
- Menocal, Maria Rosa, *Why Iberia?* (2006) The Johns Hopkins University Press., 7-11.
- Nelson, Lynn H., *Christian-Muslim Relations in Eleventh-Century Spain*, (1979) University of Kansas., 195-198.
- Safran, Janina M., *Identity and Differentiation in Ninth-Century al-Andalus*, (2001) The University of Chicago Press., 573-598.
- Wiedemann, Benedict G.E., *The Kingdom of Portugal, Homage and Papal 'Fiefdom' in the Second Half of the*

Twelfth Century, (2014) *Journal of Medieval History*.,
432-445.



Grey (2016) by Puhong Li

*Alumni Articles and Essays****The Crisis Magazine. W.E.B. Dubois Instrument for Education and Inspiration.***

Anthony Alexander

Introduction

“Honesty is best, knowledge is power, do unto others as you would be done by you. Say this and act it and the nation must move toward it if not to it. But say to a people, “the only virtue is to be white “ and the people rush to the inevitable conclusion “kill the nigger””⁸². W.E.B. Du Bois made this comment questioning a dominant ideology. Race and culture determine people’s intelligence and behavior.

This ideology, racism, justified a long train of abuses. By the late 19th century, and through the early 1900s, the lynching of African Americans was common practice. Moreover, racist America would stop at nothing

⁸² Appelrouth, Scott and Desfor, Laura. *Sociological Theory in the Classical Era: Text and Readings*. California: SAGE Publications, 2009), pg. 343.

to assure disenfranchisement and the demise of African Americans. Poll taxes, literacy tests, and Jim Crow laws of the south are a few notable instances where African Americans have faced adversity from the white race⁸³. Despite these atrocities, Du Bois was simply unwilling to accept and reconcile with oppression.. With the inspiration from a poem by James Russell Lowell entitled *The Present Crisis*, and with the support of his organization the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, W.E.B. Du Bois was able to connect to over 100,000 fellow African Americans through *The Crisis* magazine⁸⁴.

William Edward Burghardt (W.E.B.) Du Bois was born on February 23rd, 1868. His parents, Mary Burghardt and Alfred Du Bois were a middle class family located in

⁸³ O'Malley, Michael. " A Blood Red Record: the 1890s and American Apartheid. (Roy Rosenzweig Center for history and new media). <https://chnm.gmu.edu/courses/122/empire/1890s.html>

⁸⁴ West, Sandra L. "*The Crisis*." *Encyclopedia of the Harlem Renaissance*. Facts On File, 2003. Accessed November 13, 2016. [http://online.infobase.com/Article/Details/160566?q=dubois crisis](http://online.infobase.com/Article/Details/160566?q=dubois%20crisis).

Great Barrington Massachusetts⁸⁵. As a young child growing up in Great Barrington, Du Bois recalls that he did not feel a social difference between other African Americans. Instead, he viewed all African Americans as equals⁸⁶. In 1883 at the age of fifteen, Du Bois became the Great Barrington correspondent for the African American newspaper entitled *The New York Globe*. During this time Du Bois documented stories about African American social life and culture⁸⁷. In June of 1884, Du Bois graduated high school at the top of his class and was asked to speak at the graduation commencement ceremony. After taking a year off to cope with the death of his mother and study, Du Bois attended Fisk University in Nashville, Tennessee in the fall of 1885⁸⁸. Du Bois graduated from Fisk University by the end of his junior year and went on to attend Harvard where he completed a

⁸⁵ Alexander, L. Shawn. *W.E.B. Du Bois: An American Intellectual and Activist*.

(Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2015). Pg. 16

⁸⁶ Alexander, pg. 18

⁸⁷ Alexander, pg. 19

⁸⁸ Alexander, pg. 20

degree in history. After receiving his degree, Du Bois went on to further his education at Harvard by writing a dissertation regarding African Americans and slavery⁸⁹. In 1890, Du Bois graduated at the top of his class and became the first African American to receive a Ph.D from Harvard⁹⁰.

Upon graduating, Du Bois began to feel the backlash from the 1883 court case, *Plessy V. Ferguson* that segregated railway cars. The result of this court case mixed with the Jim Crow laws that were taking place in the south and the overall negative perception of African Americans at this time sparked Du Bois to seek out employment in African American colleges. However, from 1881 to 1964, Jim Crow laws segregated African Americans in over twenty states. Furthermore, these laws made it interracial relationships illegal in American society. Additionally, Jim Crow laws allowed for African Americans to be refused service at any establishment at

⁸⁹ Alexander, pg. 25

⁹⁰ Alexander, pg. 26

the owner's discretion simply because they were people of color⁹¹. Breaking Jim Crow laws would result in penalties and punishments for the offenders. As a result, the sole purposes of Jim Crow laws were denying African Americans the same freedoms as their white counterparts, a triumph in which the white race was successful⁹².

Unfortunately, Jim Crow laws and segregation were not the only struggles that Du Bois's readers of *The Crisis* faced during this time. In fact, by the 1890s, there was an average of 187 cases of African Americans being lynched each year. In many cases these acts of lynching were not isolated events. Instead, these events were often times "festivals of torture" in which African Americans were brutally tortured by hundreds of participants and onlookers until their death at which time spectators would

⁹¹ Tischauser V., Leslie. *Jim Crow Laws*. (California: Greenwood Publishing, 2012). pg. xi

⁹² Tischauser V., Leslie. *Jim Crow Laws*. (California: Greenwood Publishing, 2012). Pg. xi

walk away with remains to keep as souvenirs⁹³. In regards to lynching, William Brown, a Florida resident who was first to witness these events stated, "In those days, it was kill a mule, buy another. Kill a nigger, hire another. They had to have a license to kill anything but a nigger. We was always in season⁹⁴. According to journalist and civil rights activist Ida B. Wells, reasons for lynching included but were not limited to "insubordination; talking disrespectfully; striking a white man, slapping a white boy, writing an insulting letter, a personal debt of fifty cents, a funeral bill of ten dollars, organizing sharecroppers, being too prosperous"⁹⁵.

Du Bois and the Crisis

Working diligently to advocate for oppressed and mistreated African Americans, Du Bois became the

⁹³ O'Malley, Michael. " A Blood Red Record: the 1890s and American Apartheid. (Roy Rosenzweig Center for history and new media). <https://chnm.gmu.edu/courses/122/empire/1890s.html>

⁹⁴ O'Malley, Michael. *A Blood Red Record: the 1890s and American Apartheid*.

⁹⁵ O'Malley, Michael. *A Blood Red Record: the 1890s and American Apartheid*.

director of research and publicity for the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP) in 1910, an organization where Du Bois was one of the founders⁹⁶. In addition to having a lead role in the NAACP, Du Bois was the creator of the organization's official magazine, *The Crisis*. The magazine highlighted the accomplishments of the African American community and raised awareness on the challenges African Americans faced. Du Bois regularly published articles that contained both art and news stories from around the country discussing African Americans discrimination and lynching cases.

The Crisis provided African Americans something crucial that was missing in their culture, and united them with a common struggle. It is because of *The Crisis*, that lynching and other violent acts against African Americans were brought to public eye. Moreover, *The Crisis* provided cultural education for African Americans and provided

⁹⁶ Morris, Aldon. *The Scholar Denied: W.E.B. Du Bois and the Birth of Modern Sociology*.(California: University of California Press, 2015). Pg. 135

inspiration to rise above oppression. This was true not only for issues of race, but also gender. Du Bois, the self-proclaimed “feminist father,” believed that African American women were not being shown the proper respect that they deserved.⁹⁷ With few alternatives for education, *The Crisis* became essential for African American empowerment. One African American subscriber to *The Crisis* said, “I know in my family *The Crisis* was the magazine to read and take leadership from”⁹⁸. Another African American stated, “I don’t know where the bible was in the house but I know where *The Crisis* was”⁹⁹. It became clear that *The Crisis* was more than just a magazine for African Americans during the early 1900s. To discuss the impact of *The Crisis* on African Americans, this paper focuses on African American

⁹⁷ Lemons, Gary L.. 2001. “Womanism in the Name of the “father” W.E.B. Dubois and the Problematics of Race, Patriarchy, and Art”. *Phylon* (1960-) 49 (3/4). Clark Atlanta University: 185–202. doi:10.2307/3132628. Pg. 194

⁹⁸ Morris, Aldon. *The Scholar Denied: W.E.B. Du Bois and the Birth of Modern Sociology*.(California: University of California Press, 2015), pg. 136.

⁹⁹ Morris, pg. 136.

readers of *The Crisis* who often voiced their opinions, thoughts, and concerns in many of the *Letters* section of *The Crisis* magazine. This was a section specifically for readers to connect to *The Crisis* and share their voice with Du Bois and fellow African American readers.

For Du Bois, *The Crisis* was an expression of intellectual reparations for African Americans. According to Du Bois, there was a lack of African American contributions in many aspects of modern culture. "In aesthetic theory and criticism, the negro has not yet made any worthwhile contribution"¹⁰⁰; Du Bois made this statement in an issue of *The Crisis* magazine regarding the presence of African Americans in American society. Up until the emergence of Du Bois, African American intellectuals were cast aside in American culture. However, Du Bois began to change that notion in the early 1900s with his writings and scholarly contributions to

¹⁰⁰ Castronovo, Russ. 2006. "Beauty Along the Color Line: Lynching, Aesthetics, and the "crisis"". *PMLA* 121 (5). Modern Language Association: 1443-59. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25501615>. Pg. 1443

African American studies, via NAACP's official magazine *The Crisis*.

Other than *The Crisis*, the African American population in the early 1900's had limited news sources, particularly news sources that influenced and directly addressed the concerns of African Americans. Other news sources such as *The Negro Voice*, *Opportunity Magazine*, as well as *The Chicago Defender*, for example, had a much more limited publication and did not reach as many Americans due to publication failures, lack of funding, and lack of popularity¹⁰¹.

From the mid- 1800s throughout the early 1900s, there were many different news sources for African Americans. Publications such as *North Star*, *The Chicago Defender* were amongst popular magazines for African Americans during this time in America. However, these fellow African American publications were not

¹⁰¹West, Sandra L. "*The Crisis*." *Encyclopedia of the Harlem Renaissance*. Facts On File, 2003. Accessed November 13, 2016. [http://online.infobase.com/Article/Details/160566?q=dubois crisis](http://online.infobase.com/Article/Details/160566?q=dubois%20crisis)

comparable to *The Crisis*. In fact, the magazine stands in a category in its own according to its loyal readers and supporters. Simply African Americans would not have truths about their race if it were not for *The Crisis*. This proves to be true for two different reasons. When Du Bois started *The Crisis*, he started with the belief that a black magazine would not make it in America, and became the first African American magazine to reach immense success.

Throughout the historical community, many historians have reviewed the impact of *The Crisis* on African Americans. Although these historians have different interpretations of *The Crisis*, all can concur that *The Crisis* was the “go-to” magazine regarding African American current affairs.

Historian Werner J. Lange has done extensive research and analysis on W.E.B Du Bois, as well as *The Crisis* magazine. Lange considers Du Bois to be the first social scientist for African Americans. The pursuit of being a social scientist began in 1908 after Du Bois’s home was

invaded by white supremacists. This act of racial violence sparked Du Bois to intellectual career in another direction. After World War II Du Bois published *The Negro*, which was his attempt at changing the perception of African Americans in American society. As a result, Lange proposes the argument that *The Negro* allowed Du Bois to do something that no other social scientist at that time was able to do. This is further supported with evidence that Du Bois's mission to study black culture and make intellectual inferences regarding this topic resulted in more published works on African Americans than virtually anyone else post World War II. Moreover, Lange suggests that Du Bois wrote so extensively about the African American experience because he was outraged that so many individuals were unaware of the stereotypes that plagued African Americans¹⁰².

However, even though Du Bois has an extensive catalog of writings, *The Crisis* is arguably one of his most

¹⁰² Lange, Werner J.. 1983. "W.E.B. Dubois and the First Scientific Study of Afro-america". *Phylon* (1960-) 44 (2). Clark Atlanta University: 135-46. doi:10.2307/275025. Pg. 135-138

renowned contributions due to fact that it was accessible and the topics covered in the magazine were relatable for African Americans and acted as a medium to educate them on their accomplishments as well as their challenges they faced in American society. *The Crisis* provided the reader a balance between African American art, awards, and musical achievements as well as news of violent and discriminatory acts that were taking place with African Americans. However, Castronovo argues that even though multiple issues of *The Crisis* cite both positive and negative events of with equal importance, the nature and presence of the violent acts *The Crisis* describes overshadows the positive aspects and almost alters the intent of the magazine¹⁰³. However, through personal reader accounts from *The Crisis*, it can be concluded that Castronovo's statement is not necessarily true. In fact, many readers praise Du Bois and *The Crisis* magazine for

¹⁰³ Castronovo, Russ. 2006. "Beauty Along the Color Line: Lynching, Aesthetics, and the "crisis"". *PMLA* 121 (5). Modern Language Association: 1443-59. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25501615>. Pg. 1445-1446

showing and speaking about violent acts against African Americans because the readers believe that no one else would if he did not.

Although Russ Castronovo believes the violent aspects of *The Crisis* overshadow the positive contributions, historian William M. Brewer argues it was because of Du Bois's approach to the violent and discriminatory acts that African Americans were facing that insured *The Crisis* would act as a means to restrict the discrimination from growing larger. Brewer's analysis of *The Crisis* being a means to restrict violence against African Americans is true for two different reasons. *The Crisis* did not shy away from showing violent acts against African Americans in their publication. Moreover, by June of 1919, *The Crisis* was selling over 100,000 copies nationwide.¹⁰⁴ Knowing how large his audience was, it can be concluded that Du Bois purposely published

¹⁰⁴ West, Sandra L. "The Crisis." *Encyclopedia of the Harlem Renaissance*. Facts On File, 2003. Accessed November 13, 2016. [http://online.infobase.com/Article/Details/160566?q=dubois c risis](http://online.infobase.com/Article/Details/160566?q=dubois%20crisis).

explicit material because he knew it would reach a large readership. Simply because the publication reached thousands of African Americans, *The Crisis* was not an overnight success for Du Bois. In fact, Brewer argues that Du Bois faced many roadblocks producing *The Crisis* through the NAACP. More specifically, Du Bois was fired from the organization after lynching investigator Walter White became the chief of staff of the NAACP. Brewer further argues that this termination from the NAACP did not break Du Bois's spirit. He believes that Du Bois never sought out to be the leader of the African American community. Instead, Du Bois sought to further the African American community through his contributions to *The Crisis*¹⁰⁵.

Although Du Bois wanted to further the African American community, one historian believes that Du Bois did not receive the proper credit for doing so. In *The*

¹⁰⁵ Brewer, William M.. 1968. "Some Memories of Dr. W. E. B. Dubois". *The Journal of Negro History* 53 (4). Association for the Study of African American Life and History, Inc.: 345-48. doi:10.2307/2716358. Pg. 347

Scholar Denied: W.E.B Du Bois and the Birth of Modern Sociology, author Aldon Morris makes the claim that sociologist Robert E. Park has been credited for some of Du Bois's accomplishments because Park's work has overshadowed Du Bois. Additionally, Morris argues that Du Bois has not been given enough credit for advocating for women in the early 1900s. Morris provided a statement from Du Bois; "The statement that women is weaker than man is sheer rot. It is the same sort of thing that we hear about "darker races" and "lower classes". Difference, either physical or spiritual does not argue weakness or inferiority."¹⁰⁶ In addition to *The Crisis* creating a forum for all issues regarding African Americans, it also advocated for African American women. Therefore, it is evident that even in the early 1900's DuBois was passionate about eradicating injustices of all kinds, including discrimination against women.

¹⁰⁶ Morris, Aldon. *The Scholar Denied: W.E.B. Du Bois and the Birth of Modern Sociology*.(California: University of California Press, 2015) Pg. 135

For African American women, *The Crisis* plays a crucial role in empowerment. Throughout *The Crisis*, there is a lot of evidence that indicates how much this publication meant to African American women. Additionally, because African American women were inspired by the words of *The Crisis*, white women attempt to remove it from their lives in fear of it causing an up rise. For this, and the previously stated reasons, it becomes clear that the intentions of W.E.B. Du Bois and his magazine *The Crisis* was to act as a tool to empower African Americans in the early 1900s. Du Bois makes it clear that all issues regarding African Americans are equally important, regardless if they are positive or negative. For those reasons, *The Crisis* was more than just an African American publication. *The Crisis* served a variety of different purposes. Throughout *The Crisis*, Du Bois shares many images that depicted African Americans being lynched and brought that issue to the forefronts in American culture. Also, *The Crisis* gave African Americans a forum in a society where they were considered less than

the white race that oppressed them. It becomes clear that W.E.B. Du Bois's work with the NAACP and *The Crisis* was having a positive impact on all African Americans during the early 1900s.

Even though Du Bois made such an impact on the African American community, historians Dan S. Green and Earl Smith argue that Du Bois's work involving *The Crisis* went unrecognized and unappreciated until years after his death in 1963. Based on Du Bois' approach to economic, political, racial and class oppression, Green and Smith see Du Bois was not just a social scientist, but as a theoretician. Equally interesting, Du Bois, as a young scholar, produced a relatable scholarship to African Americans. Here, these historians argued, is possible to find a key for *The Crisis'* success.¹⁰⁷

The feature of relatability is also highlighted by Historian Gary L. Lemons. For him, Du Bois's contribution to *The Crisis* was ahead of its time, and was

¹⁰⁷ Green, Dan S., and Earl Smith. 1983. "W.E.B. Dubois and the Concepts of Race and Class". *Phylon* (1960-) 44 (4). Clark Atlanta University: 262-72. doi:10.2307/274576.

easily relatable for African Americans because they were able to connect to the struggles and adversities that Du Bois often wrote about. The latter feature is evident. This is evident on a piece Du Bois contributed to *The Crisis* entitled "So the girl marries", featured in an issue published in February 1918. On that piece Du Bois deals with the African American women's interpretation of liberation in American culture. Lemons notes that Du Bois uses his wife and daughter as examples in his article. Moreover, Du Bois attempts to offer up a universal interpretation on the issue instead of personal, in order to make his philosophy applicable to the reader¹⁰⁸.

As it is evident, historiography agrees on the revolutionary nature of *The Crisis*. This paper contributes to this conversation by arguing that *The Crisis* was a tool of empowerment based on its ability to educate African Americans on their oppression and talents.

¹⁰⁸ Lemons, Gary L.. 2001. "Womanism in the Name of the "father" W.E.B. Dubois and the Problematics of Race, Patriarchy, and Art". *Phylon* (1960-) 49 (3/4). Clark Atlanta University: 185-202. doi:10.2307/3132628. Pg. 193-195

Being among one the most influential African American publication at the time, Du Bois made it a point to post actual images of the many atrocities committed against African Americans by being acting as a direct and explicit news source of actual pictures and detailed descriptions than any other news source. Bringing these examples of violence to the mainstream brought the tragedies out of the shadows of American culture and towards the forefront of the change needed to better the lives of African Americans. African American adults recognized the power of *The Crisis*, and the impact that the content could have on empowering youth and helping to understand the difficulties faced by their race and be a source of inspiration.

As *The Crisis* specifically impacted youth, the African American population as a whole benefited from the well-constructed, informed political opinions disseminated in the publication each month, influencing everything from politics to activism to racial pride. As the racial pride began to grow amongst readers of *The Crisis*,

activism began to grow as the atrocities committed against African Americans sparked a desire to fight back amongst the injustices thru activism. This activism was so powerful amongst the African American community that racist people began dissuading and preventing the African American population from reading the publication because of the truths *The Crisis* told. It is for these reasons that *The Crisis* was one of the most important pieces of African American literature during the 1900s. Without a guiding voice such as *The Crisis*, African Americans would not have a primary source that encompasses the struggles within their culture and the inspiration to persevere.

Due to the popularity of *The Crisis*, Du Bois was never seriously challenged by other African American publications.¹⁰⁹

By the start of the 1900s, *Voice of the Negro*, and other African American publications quickly began to go out of business. This demise of these publications took

¹⁰⁹Pendergast, Tom. *Creating the Modern Man: American Magazines and Consumer Culture, 1900-1950*. (Missouri: University of Missouri Press, 2015). Pg. 136

place for two reasons. Prior to the overwhelming popularity of *The Crisis*, African American magazines had very low subscription numbers, which forced publication to close their doors. Additionally, other African American publications failures can be attributed to the fact that they had little funding because racist advertisers did not want to advertise in magazines geared towards African Americans¹¹⁰. In a July 1912 edition of *The Crisis*, reader and supporter Esau Harris from Cutler, Ohio contributed his thoughts to the *Letters* section of the magazine, a section in which Du Bois dedicated solely to the thoughts and opinions of his readers. Furthermore, Harris confirms the statement that African Americans would be lacking a legitimate publication if it were not for *The Crisis*. Harris states, "I am pleased to know that we have such a paper as *The Crisis*. If the whole family of colored newspapers were more like it, how much better it would be for our race. Here in the community we have settled the "Race

¹¹⁰Pendergast, Tom. *Creating the Modern Man: American Magazines and Consumer Culture, 1900-1950*. (Missouri: University of Missouri Press, 2015). Pg. 109

Problem,” and some of our people, in fact most all are shortsighted enough to think it is settled everywhere”¹¹¹. This excerpt from Harris is clear evidence that other African American publications during this time were not comparable to *The Crisis* magazine. Harris alludes to the fact that other African American magazines suggest that the race issues in America were solved across the United States. However, Harris suggests that because of *The Crisis*, he is able to recognize these pressing issues facing Americans are not solved nation wide. It is for that reason *The Crisis* proves to be the elite magazine for African Americans during this time. Based on the fact that there were virtually no publications for African Americans at the start of the 1900s, it can be concluded based on the accounts of its readers, that *The Crisis* was the only magazine that was properly serving the African American community.

¹¹¹W.E.B. Du, Bois *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, July 1912, Harris, Esau, *Letters*.

Additionally, Esau Harris is not the only individual that recognizes that exposure to a true African American news source may have not been discovered if it were not for *The Crisis*. In the *Letters* section of the November 1913 edition of *The Crisis*, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania resident, Luther L. Newman suggests that there is no other reliable African American news source than *The Crisis*. "I desire to herewith to express my approval of *The Crisis* for its frankness and the truthfulness concerning the outrage, indignities and injuries inflicted on the Negro by white races and epically by the American white man. *The Crisis* is full of information concerning the advancement of the Negro along all walks of life; it puts the Negro in touch with the general advancement and uplift of his race and affords a source of information to be acquired nowhere else"¹¹². According to Newman, if it were not for *The Crisis*, African Americans would be unable to receive the information that the publication produces from any other

¹¹² W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, November 1913, Newman, Luther L., *Letters*.

source. This is evidence that *The Crisis* was the only reliable news source for African Americans during this time. Additionally, a fellow member of the newspaper business wrote to the *Letters* section to inform the publication that he had never seen a more attractive magazine cover. Moreover, he went on to state that, “it stood out conspicuously on all newsstands, and seemed to exercise much “drawing power”¹¹³. As a result, it is for these reasons that without *The Crisis* magazine African Americans would struggle to have a news source that truly identified with their race because previous news publications failed to do so for different reasons.

Throughout America during the 1800s, African Americans were the victim of many crimes and atrocities committed by racist individuals. African Americans were mistreated, beaten, disenfranchised from society, and in some cases lynched for simply being an African American individual. News reporting in the 1900s was not on the

¹¹³ W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NACCP, June 1912, Northrop, W.B., *Letters*.

scale of how Americans receive information today. Due to the mistreatment of African Americans in society, it can be assumed that major news outlets did not report on unjust acts that were taking place because of how African Americans were viewed by the majority population. However, *The Crisis* did not shy away from these issues. As an African American news source, Du Bois made it a point to print disturbing images in order to show his readers the atrocities that were taking place against the African race.

By the 1890s, lynching African Americans became a festival- like gathering. These acts were often times extremely sadistic and only reported about in local newspapers¹¹⁴. However, readers of *The Crisis* expressed their admiration for the boldness Du Bois showed in publishing explicit content such as lynching for his readers to see. In the July 1912 edition of *The Crisis*, a reader expressed their thoughts on the content Du Bois

¹¹⁴ O'Malley, Michael. *A Blood Red Record: the 1890s and American Apartheid*.

chose to publish. "The January number is splendid. I enjoyed it greatly. I wish those pictures of lynching could be put upon the moving picture roll. That way, and only that way, will they speak to the multiplied thousands their sad truth. We often see upon the canvas the pictures of Indian cruelty to the white man; can't we turn it around and show them that white man's brutishness to the Negro?"¹¹⁵. Based on reader Louise McDonald's claim to *The Crisis*, it becomes clear that African American violence in America is not receiving nearly as much attention as it should be due to the fact the this reader wishes to see more of these explicit pictures on display for the public to see. However, because Du Bois decided to publish these disturbing images in *The Crisis*, and since *The Crisis* was a nationwide publication, one can conclude that *The Crisis* brought African American injustices to national headlines when they may have not been otherwise.

¹¹⁵ W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, July 1912, McDonald, Louise, *Letters*.

Although Du Bois published explicit content with the intention to show his readers what African Americans were facing in society, he strategically allowed his readers to become reporters as well. In the April 1913 edition of *The Crisis*, an anonymous reader shared a story of violence against African Americans. "This is only among the few atrocious acts committed by the white officers down here: The fourth Sunday morning in November, at Beaumont, East of Hattiesburg (Miss.), at the Kansas City Railroad junction, a marshal killed a young colored man because he made a mistake in entering a white waiting room"¹¹⁶. This statement from this anonymous author is evidence that Du Bois took into close consideration what he chose to publish in *The Crisis*. By publishing this story, Du Bois is exposing his audience to true accounts from fellow readers of *The Crisis*. As a result, other African American readers will be able to identify with other readers of *The Crisis* and be able to relate to one another through the

¹¹⁶ W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, April 1913, Anonymous, *Letters*.

publication. Based on this evidence, it can be concluded that *The Crisis* brought cruelty against African American to the forefronts in American culture during the early 1900s. Moreover, because of *The Crisis* African Americans were able to share their experience with fellow members of their race, and with the entire nation, simultaneously.

The Crisis had an impact on many African Americans during its time of publication. Not only did the magazine give African Americans something to gravitate towards, it also brought lynching and African American brutalities into mainstream America. However, adult aged African Americans were not the only ones feeling the impact of *The Crisis* on their culture. In fact, *The Crisis* had a profound impact on African American youths in America during this time. Additionally, Jim Crow laws were negatively impacting African American students. These laws denied African Americans students the right to an equal education opportunity¹¹⁷. Moreover, in their

¹¹⁷ Tischauser V., Leslie. *Jim Crow Laws*. (California: Greenwood Publishing, 2012). Pg. 49

segregated schools, African Americans were taught how to accept their inequality to their white counterparts and how to stay “in their place”¹¹⁸. Consequently, these factors had a negative impact on African Americans. By 1916, 95% of secondary aged southern African Americans were not enrolled in public institutions. Furthermore, 97% of these African Americans were not enrolled at all¹¹⁹. In the *Letters* section of the June 1912 edition of *The Crisis*, Grace Mosley, the librarian of St. Augustine’s School in an undisclosed location describes that *The Crisis* is assuming a role in which the education system is failing to do. Mosley states, “I had hoped to confine the reading of *The Crisis* to our older students. It is valuable for them and teachers-but the younger members of the school-sixth and seventh grade students-have taken hold of it. They do not appreciate it, and are only using its sad and tragic side as matters of sensational gossip. For that reason I must ask to

¹¹⁸ Tischauser V., Leslie. *Jim Crow Laws*. (California: Greenwood Publishing, 2012). Pg. 46

¹¹⁹ Moore, Rosetta. *The Impact of Slavery On the Education of Blacks in Orange Country, North Carolina: 1619-1970*.(North Carolina: Lulu Publishing Services, 2015). Pg. 167

have *The Crisis* discontinued from the March number”¹²⁰ This statement from Grace Mosley demonstrates a clear divide on how school-aged African American students are responding to *The Crisis*. Grace Mosley is able to see that *The Crisis* is a powerful source of current affairs for African Americans and that it would be highly beneficial for those students to indulge in what *The Crisis* provides. Although the younger students in the school are taking what is being published in *The Crisis* as a source for school “gossip”, Grace Mosley fails to recognize the effect the publication is having on younger students. The fact that the younger students are talking about *The Crisis* amongst fellow students is evidence that African American students are concerned with the issues that are affecting their culture. Based on the fact that younger students are using the “sad” and “tragic” stories as a talking point is representative that these stories are affecting their lives and *The Crisis* is providing them an outlet to be informed

¹²⁰ W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, June 1912, Moseley, Grace, *Letters*.

about issues that are affecting African Americans. For Grace Mosley to discontinue the school's subscription to *The Crisis* for this reason is not only baffling but also irresponsible. It is doing a disservice as a librarian to deny students a particular publication based off of how the students are discussing the issues in which they are being exposed to. More specifically, this is negligent due to the fact that African Americans had severe struggles in regards to a fair and appropriate education in America.

Although librarian Grace Mosley recognized the positive effect *The Crisis* was having on school-aged students and failed them, this was not the overall consensus regarding *The Crisis* and African American minors. In fact, in the same June 1912 edition of *The Crisis* Chicago Illinois resident, A.L. Weaver wrote, "You will please send my *Crisis* in the name of my daughter. She is not quite a year old yet, but I want to begin early in interesting her in race pride and race journals"¹²¹. This

¹²¹ W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, June 1912, Weaver, A.L., *Letters*.

excerpt shows genuine concern that a parent has for their daughter in regards to educating her on the African American culture. “*The Crisis*’ ability to reach a wider audience became evident on another letter on the same issue, a Chicago, Illinois resident, A.L. Weaver’s submission to the publication is proof that *The Crisis* is an impactful and trusted source of information for African Americans. Weaver is able to identify the importance of *The Crisis* and pass that knowledge down to his or her daughter. This excerpt is extremely important not only in demonstrating the validity of *The Crisis* magazine, but to further illustrate that this publication was not only important to African American adults, but to younger readers as well.

Based on findings in *The Crisis* magazine, it becomes clear that the publication was having a profound effect on African American youths in America during the early 1900s. The theme of positive effects on African Americans is key in examining the impact of the publication. Moreover, the magazine acted as primary

source in educating African Americans politically and providing them the insight on how to elect a candidate that will best meet their needs. Throughout Du Bois's time as editor, he attempts to educate fellow African Americans politically by sharing his personal thoughts and insights throughout *The Crisis*.

Not only did *The Crisis* help inform African Americans of the atrocities happening to their race on a nationwide level, it provided a much-needed resource of political information geared towards black Americans. In the June 1915 edition of *The Crisis*, reader G.T-Jones exclaimed "I want to thank *The Crisis* for showing me how to vote for principals rather than parties"¹²². Voting in America was not a right of passage for African Americans. After Reconstruction, African Americans struggled to have a political voice in society. By the late 1880s, racist politicians had made a myriad of attempts to completely disenfranchise African Americans from the voting

¹²² W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, June 1915, Jones, G. T, *Letters*.

process. Most notably poll tax, eight box law, and literacy tests were put into action to insure that African Americans were unable to vote. During the 1890s, state government made the disenfranchisement of African Americans legal, resulting in not having the ability to vote at all.¹²³ Because of *The Crisis*, African Americans who were allowed to vote during this time are able to make an informed decision. *The Crisis* provided eligible African Americans insight about what a candidate believed in instead of what party they were representing. It is for that reason *The Crisis* acted as a primary source for politically educating African Americans in America.

In addition to politically educating African Americans via *The Crisis*, Du Bois also provides insight to his own political philosophy. In March of 1913, Woodrow Wilson entered office to serve as the United States president. However, Du Bois did not agree with Wilson's politics and he shared that throughout *The Crisis* and

¹²³ Washington, Margaret, "Margaret Washington: Obstacles faced by African Americans" Public Broadcasting Service. ACS. October 29, 2016.

within a letter he personally wrote Wilson upon entering office. In the letter, Du Bois informs Wilson that his Presidency is taking a step back in America. Additionally, Du Bois went on to state, “The presidency, the senate, the house of representatives passes on the 4th of March into the hands of the party which a half century ago fought desperately to keep black men as real estate in the eyes of the law”¹²⁴. Du Bois argues that the African American vote did not go towards Wilson because they believed in him, rather it was to gain independence and become the “Abraham Lincoln” of modern times.

Du Bois’s letter to President Wilson shows that he had two different motives in writing the letter. Du Bois wanted to effectively inform President Wilson that he expected him to work closely with the African American community and assist progressing the African race. Du Bois specifically tells Wilson, “whatever negro it is that

¹²⁴ Du Bois, W. E. B. (William Edward Burghardt), 1868-1963. Letter from W. E. B. Du Bois to President Woodrow Wilson, ca. November 1918. W. E. B. Du Bois Papers (MS 312). Special Collections and University Archives, University of Massachusetts Amherst

your southern friends know, it is your duty to know the real Negro and know him personally"¹²⁵. However, informing Wilson of his expectations was not Du Bois sole concern. Du Bois wanted to show his fellow African Americans how the political system was dominated by white elites. By publishing the letter to Woodrow Wilson, Du Bois is bringing to light how his political party has affected African Americans. Moreover, in this letter to Wilson, Du Bois criticized his intentions regarding the African American community. furthermore, Du Bois urges Wilson to take a legitimate interest in the African American community for they will be the biggest asset to a progressive American culture. As a result of these statements, a reader of *The Crisis* praises Du Bois in his ability to inform African Americans on how to vote for what a party truly believes in and not just the party itself. For these reasons, it becomes clear that W.E.B. Du Bois

¹²⁵ Du Bois, W. E. B. (William Edward Burghardt), 1868-1963. Letter from W. E. B. Du Bois to President Woodrow Wilson.

and *The Crisis* magazine acted as a primary source for politically educating African Americans.

The Crisis provided hope by highlighting African American accomplishments. In the midst of all the struggles that African Americans were facing in American society in the 1900s, *The Crisis*, acted as an escape for many African Americans. However, for some African Americans *The Crisis* was viewed differently than just a monthly publication. In fact, *The Crisis* was a source of inspiration for many African American readers. Although the magazine dealt with a wide variety of issues facing African Americans, *The Crisis* also provided hope, optimism, and inspiration for those who were readers. Each edition of *The Crisis* featured a section entitled *Men of the Month*. In this section of the publication, Du Bois took a moment away from pressing issues, and complex ideals to highlight African Americans who were doing wonderful things in America. Du Bois allowed the readers of *The Crisis* to see what their fellow African Americans were achieving, and as a result, provide his readers something

to believe in and look forward to in the African American community.

For some African Americans, the monthly publication of *The Crisis* was a time to share together. In fact, for two African American women, *The Crisis* was their opportunity to spend time together and identify with the issues regarding their race. In the June 1912 edition of *The Crisis* avid reader, Alida Gray shared her experience with the magazine. "Mother and I deliberately dropped our work and sat down to read and read till we have exhausted the contents, and applauded in very many instances, especially in reading "Along the Color Line," "Educational" and "Art" notes. We glory in the home"¹²⁶. *The Crisis* was more than just a source of news for African Americans. For Alida Gray, it is a time to spend together indulging on issues that affect their race. Additionally, Gray expressed the multiple sections of *The Crisis* have inspired her to applaud the work of Du Bois due to the

¹²⁶ W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, June 1912, Gray, Alida, *Letters*.

fact he is able to relate to his fellow African American readers. It is clear that Alida Gray viewed *The Crisis* as much more than just another publication for African Americans.

Alida Gray is not alone in giving praise to *The Crisis* and Du Bois for helping inspire the African American race. In the July 1912 edition of *The Crisis* a reader submitted a piece to the *Letters* section of the magazine with high reviews of the publication's work. Charles Edward Russell wrote, "I ought also to tell you of the great satisfaction with which I reader *The Crisis*. It is an admirable publication; I don't see how it could be better. It fills the bill exactly, and I think we ought to thank you for it. I do every month"¹²⁷. For Russell, *The Crisis* is a magazine that he truly believes in. Moreover, *The Crisis* is providing Russell exactly what needs in terms of African American current affairs. The fact that Charles Russell feels compelled to thank Du Bois and *The Crisis* monthly

¹²⁷W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, July 1912, Russell, Charles Edward, *Letters*.

for the publication speaks volumes to the power the magazine had on the African American community.

For African Americans, *The Crisis* was much more than a monthly magazine that dealt with issues regarding their race and culture. The magazine promoted knowledge for a race that was out casted by the majority of American society. It is because of statements like Alida Gray's and Charles Edward Russell that it can be concluded that *The Crisis* was more than just a magazine to African Americans. Some individuals looked forward to the publication each month while others viewed reading *The Crisis* as a time to bond with loved ones who share a common bond over race and culture in the African American community.

Excerpts from *The Crisis* demonstrates had publication positive effect on African Americans during the early 20th century. Many of the magazine's readers submitted overwhelming admiration for what *The Crisis* provided to their lives. However, other races in American culture saw these profound effects as well. In fact, white

women from both the North and South were beginning to recognize that influence that *The Crisis* was having on African Americans. Unfortunately, the positive effects did not delight the white women that wrote to the *Letters* section of the magazine on two separate occasions. In fact, they wished that the African American women they knew had never come in contact with *The Crisis* magazine.

African American women faced similar, if not more struggles than their males counterparts in American society during the height of *The Crisis*. As a result, primary evidence suggests that fellow white women did not wish to see a rise in their literacy. In the *Letters* section of the March 1912 edition of *The Crisis*, a southern woman contributed the following, "Dear Sir, I feel more or less at liberty to make a comment regarding *The Crisis*, since for many years I have been deeply interested, and have done many things for the advancement of the Negro race in America. For several months I have been a subscriber to your magazine, have looked it over carefully each issue, and put it into the hands of my maid as in interesting

thing, perhaps, for her to read in a leisure hour. And I have watched its effect, which has not been a good one. Now I want to say this, and from the bottom of my heart; you are making a grave mistake in pointing out the woes of the Negro race which are no greater-if as great-as the woes of the white man. Besides, to point them out is not the way to remedy the evil that exists, if evil there does exist"¹²⁸. This statement by this southern white woman makes it apparent that she has never done anything to contribute to advancing the African American community. If she had, one can concur that she would interpret *The Crisis* to be a wonderful source of reading for her maid and encourage her to continue to do so. However, that is not the case. Instead, the woman insists that Du Bois cease to point out the faults of white people in the magazine because in her opinion it is simply "not good". This woman makes this request to Du Bois because she is able to recognize the positive effect *The Crisis* is

¹²⁸ W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, March 1912, "A southern white woman", *Letters*.

having on the African American community and as a result wishes that it would cease so African Americans will continue to be uninformed about issues regarding their race. Moreover, it is clear that this woman is truly interested in keeping African Americans down solely based on the tone of her letter and the request in which she makes to Du Bois.

The feelings this woman expressed were not only those of southern states. In fact, a northern woman said something remarkably similar in the November 1913 edition of *The Crisis*. "Mrs. Edward L. Buckley's subscription to *The Crisis* expires December 1913. Will you kindly discontinue sending it after this date? To my understanding its influence is inflammatory and in that way far from beneficial to the race"¹²⁹. This excerpt from *The Crisis* acts as further evidence to illustrate that white women were attempting to remove *The Crisis* from the hands of African Americans because they are able to see

¹²⁹ W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, November 1913, "A northern white woman", *Letters*.

the positive effects that the publication is having on their race. As a result, they wish to take it away from them in order for white people to continue to take advantage of their race and culture. This woman does not provide substantial evidence to prove that *The Crisis* is having a negative effect on African Americans besides the publication being “inflammatory” to her “understanding”. Therefore, it is for these reasons that white women attempted to discourage African Americans from reading *The Crisis* because they were able to see the positive effect it was having on their race and as a result wished it be put to rest.

Conclusion

For many African Americans, *The Crisis* was more than just a monthly publication aimed at sharing ideas and issues within their community. For one reader, *The Crisis* was of more importance than the Catholic faith, “I don’t know where the bible was in the house but I know where *The Crisis* was”. Speaking directly to the influence that

W.E.B. Du Bois's publication had on the daily operations of an African American's life, this quote comes directly from an African American reader of *The Crisis* and it speaks volumes to the profound effect it has had on African Americans in the early 1900s. Throughout American history, African Americans have faced many adversities in struggling to gain equality to their white counterparts in American society. Many of times African Americans were mistreated, segregated, and even murdered for having a different skin tone than their white counterparts. However, through these tough times for African Americans, Du Bois was able to unite African Americans through publication, and help bring them together with the purpose of education, common beliefs, and common struggles. In 1910, W.E.B. Du Bois published *The Crisis* magazine through the NAACP. However, this magazine was more than a simple source of information regarding African Americans. In fact, many readers turned to *The Crisis* for guidance, inspiration, and a source of optimism for the African American community.

Early on in his career fighting for the rights of African Americans, Du Bois said, "We face a condition, not a theory."¹³⁰ This quote is extremely representative of his perception and intentions with *The Crisis* magazine. Du Bois's mission remained steadfast throughout his time with *The Crisis*. Informing, enlightening, and advancing the African American race was the main priority. As a result of Du Bois's mission, his success is seen throughout reader testimonies of *The Crisis* magazine. However, *The Crisis* was much more than a publication geared towards African Americans. In fact, the magazine was a way of life for many African Americans during the early 1900s. Due to *The Crisis*, African Americans were provided with a legitimate news source that was representative of their culture and struggles in American society. Moreover, the profound impact of *The Crisis* is deeply important because it gave African Americans something to believe in, and inspired a race of people to overcome adversities

¹³⁰ Smith, Robert C., "DuBois, W.E.B." *Encyclopedia of African-American politics, Second Edition*.

perpetrated by the white race. Due to African American personal accounts, without *The Crisis*, there would not have been much in the way of alternative news sources that highlighted African Americans in American culture. Additionally, Du Bois had a unique vision in terms of publication. Because of Du Bois, *The Crisis* brought lynching and many other atrocities against African Americans to the forefronts of American media by publishing disturbing images and stories for the world to embrace.

Consequently, *The Crisis* shed light on major African American issues that may have otherwise been disregarded and cast aside into the shadows of white America. Although on the surface *The Crisis* would be received as a magazine for adult African Americans, the truths that live deep in the magazine's core would argue otherwise. *The Crisis* magazine played a role in the lives of African American youths in many ways. School aged African Americans read the magazine with the hopes of becoming educated on the current affairs that were

influencing their society and culture. Additionally, African American parents saw the importance of *The Crisis* and made it a point to use the magazine as a source of education. *The Crisis* also played a role in politically educating African Americans in American society. Without this publication, the future of politically educated African Americans is unclear. Aside from being a source of African American education, *The Crisis* played a dual role in inspiring the culture. Many readers wrote to Du Bois with admiration about how his magazine inspired them with the stories he shared in a monthly basis. African Americans were not the only ones witnessing the inspiration *The Crisis* brought on. In fact, white women in both the North and the South were discouraging black African Americans from reading the publication because the effect it was having was profound and true that it must be stopped in their eyes. Based on the evidence provided through *The Crisis* magazine, and members of the African American community, it is clear that W.E.B. Du Bois's work with *The Crisis* magazine was among the

most important and inspirational pieces of African American literature and truly helped forward their race and culture through additional exposure to political matters, education opportunities, atrocities against African Americans by serving as the only long-lasting African American publication.

Annotated Bibliography

- Du Bois, W. E. B. (William Edward Burghardt), 1868-1963. Letter from W. E. B. Du Bois to President Woodrow Wilson, ca. November 1918. W. E. B. Du Bois Papers (MS 312). Special Collections and University Archives, University of Massachusetts Amherst Libraries

This source was a letter Du Bois wrote to President Woodrow Wilson regarding his thoughts and concerns about his presidency. I used this source to illustrate how Du Bois openly shared his political views with his readers and how it in turn, educated his readers on political issues.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, June 1912, Gray, Alid. A, *Letters*.

This source is from the *Letters* section of *The Crisis*. In this excerpt, the reader talks about how the magazine brought her and her mother together and allowed them to bond over a common struggle. I used

information to add to the argument that *The Crisis* was more than just a monthly publication. In fact, it brought families closer together.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, July 1912, Harris, Esau, *Letters*.

In this excerpt from *The Crisis* a reader express his admiration for the publication and how other African American journalists should take note of Du Bois. This statement was important to forwarding my argument that African Americans would not have much of an alternative in regards to an exclusive black publication if it were not for *The Crisis*.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, July 1912, McDonald, Louise, *Letters*.

This excerpt from *The Crisis* comes from avid reader Mrs. Louise McDonald regarding Du Bois publishing images of lynching in the magazine. McDonald states that she likes that Du Bois published those images

because it brought the issue of lynching to mainstream America. I used this to extended my argument that Du Bois brought lynching into mainstream America.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, November 1913, Newman, Luther L., *Letters*.

In this letter from the *Letters* section of *The Crisis* reader Luther Newman states that the honesty, importance, and visuals of the publication is not be acquired anywhere else. I used this quote to further my argument of *The Crisis* being the leading magazine for African Americans.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, June 1912, Northrop, W.B., *Letters*.

This excerpt comes from a reader who also works in the publication industry. I used this quote to further my argument that *The Crisis* was truly a one of a kind publication in American society.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, July 1912, Russell, Charles Edward, *Letters*.

This excerpt from Charles Russell is regarding his admiration for Du Bois and *The Crisis*. This excerpt is used to forward the argument about *The Crisis* acting as a source of inspiration for African Americans.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, June 1915, Jones, G. T, *Letters*.

This excerpt from the *Letters* section of *The Crisis* is from a reader thanking Du Bois for informing him how to vote. I use this source to expand the argument that *The Crisis* helped to educate African Americans on politics in a society where that idea was frowned upon.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, June 1912, "A southern white woman" *Letters*.

This excerpt from anonymous southern women is about how a white woman gave her maid a copy of *The Crisis* to read in her spare time. However, the white woman believes that the information in the magazine is "dangerous" to her African American maid. This excerpt was used to argue the influence of *The Crisis* and how white people wanted to remove that from African Americans.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, April 1913, "A northern white woman", *Letters*.

This is another excerpt where a white woman attempts to remove *The Crisis* from an African American woman because she deems the publication to be "inflammatory" and "far from beneficial". I use this source to further the argument that as a result of *The Crisis* being so impactful, white woman attempted to keep it away from African Americans.

- W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Crisis*, New York, NAACP, September 1913, *Anonymous Letters*.

This excerpt from *The Crisis* is regarding a reader sharing a story about a young man that was killed in Mississippi for accidentally entering a white waiting room. This information was used to prove the point that without *The Crisis* many violent acts against African Americans may have went undocumented in any other news source.

- Alexander, L. Shawn. *W.E.B. Du Bois: An American Intellectual and Activist*. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2015.

This book details the intellectual life of W.E.B Du Bois spread over a timeline filled with academic accomplishments, African American advocacy, contributions to the field of sociology, and Du Bois's experience working with *The Crisis* magazine as director and editor. This source was useful to my research because it provided information on *The Crisis*,

as well as information on other African American news publications like *The Defender* and *The Voice of the Negro*.

- Appelrouth, Scott and Desfor, Laura. *Sociological Theory in the Classical Era: Text and Readings*. California: SAGE Publications, 2009).

In this book I extracted a quote from Du Bois.

“Honesty is best, knowledge is power, do unto others as you would be done by you. Say this and act it and the nation must move toward it if not to it. But say to a people, “the only virtue is to be white “ and the people rush to the inevitable conclusion “kill the nigger””. I used the quote for the introduction of my research to set the tone of the treatment of African Americans during the time of *The Crisis*.

- Brewer, William M.. 1968. "Some Memories of Dr. W. E. B. Dubois". *The Journal of Negro History* 53 (4). Association for the Study of African American Life and History, Inc.

This journal article details the experience William M. Brewer had with W.E.B Du Bois. Brewer gained this experience from being an avid reader of Du Bois's work, which made him feel like he had a true connection to Du Bois. Additionally, he analyzed who he was a person and an intellectual. This journal was helpful to my research because it detailed the struggles and roadblocks Du Bois faced while working with *The Crisis*.

- Castronovo, Russ. 2006. "Beauty Along the Color Line: Lynching, Aesthetics, and the "crisis"". *PMLA* 121 (5). Modern Language Association.

In this article, Castronovo makes the argument that W.E.B Du Bois and *The Crisis* magazine aimed to make connections to art and lynching as a form of

propaganda. This article was useful to my research because it provided me a very insightful quote from Du Bois.

- Green, Dan S., and Earl Smith. 1983. "W.E.B. Dubois and the Concepts of Race and Class". *Phylon* (1960-) 44 (4). Clark Atlanta University: doi:10.2307/274576

This article provides an overview of W.E.B Du Bois life as a scholar and researcher. Additionally, these authors analyze Du Bois's complex views regarding race relations in the United States as well as social and economic classes. This article was useful to my research because the authors provide information that proves Du Bois to be much more than just a social scientist. Moreover, this article was insightful because the authors state that Du Bois's work with *The Crisis* went unappreciated until years after his death.

- Lange, Werner J.. 1983. "W.E.B. Dubois and the First Scientific Study of Afro-america". *Phylon* (1960-) 44 (2). Clark Atlanta University: 135-46. doi:10.2307/275025.

This article details the professional works of W.E.B Du Bois and the acknowledgments that he has never been publically recognized for. Lange makes the claim that Du Bois was the first African American to write intellectually about the African American experience in America. This article was useful to my research because it provided context to why Du Bois decided to advocate for African Americans.

- Lemons, Gary L.. 2001. "Womanism in the Name of the "father" W.E.B. Dubois and the Problematics of Race, Patriarchy, and Art". *Phylon* (1960-) 49 (3/4). Clark Atlanta University: 185-202. doi:10.2307/3132628.

This article covered a few different issues regarding W.E.B Du Bois. One of the main focuses in this piece is Du Bois's view on art and how he only enjoyed art forms that promoted propaganda of some sort. Also,

the author discusses how the terms “mother” and “father” should be used in society. This article was important to my research because It provided a backdrop about how African Americans related to the crisis

- Moore, Rosetta .*The Impact of Slavery On the Education of Blacks in Orange Country, North Carolina: 1619-1970.*(North Carolina: Lulu Publishing Services, 2015).

This book heavily discussed how slavery and Jim Crow Laws impacted education for African Americans. I used the information from this book to quote statistics for African Americans enrolled in schools and records of enrollment rates.

- Morris, Aldon. *The Scholar Denied: W.E.B. Du Bois and the Birth of Modern Sociology.* California: University of California Press, 2015.

This book argues that W.E.B Du Bois has not received the proper recognition of his contributions to the field

of African American studies, as well as sociology. This text provided useful information of the impact of *The Crisis* and how African Americans viewed the magazine during its booming years. This was helpful to my research by providing information on what African Americans had in regards to publications that supported their race. Additionally, the argument proposed by Aldon is usefully in answering my question as to why the work of W.E.B Du Bois is relatively unknown to the mass population.

- O'Malley, Michael. " A Blood Red Record: the 1890s and American Apartheid. (Roy Rosenzweig Center for history and new media).

<https://chnm.gmu.edu/courses/122/empire/1890s.html>

The main subject from this source consisted of Jim Crow Laws of the south, as well as many other hardships African Americans were facing in society. I used this source to extract information about Jim Crow

Laws, lynching, and segregation. Additionally, this source provided me a quote from an African American man who was a witness to lynching .

- Pendergast, Tom. *Creating the Modern Man: American Magazines and Consumer Culture, 1900-1950*. (Missouri: University of Missouri Press, 2015).

This book source pertains to the many different news sources and publications from 1900-1950. Pendergast makes the claim that *The Crisis* was the reigning black magazine from 1916-1936. Additionally, I used the information that no other magazine has challenged *The Crisis* and the helped show the power of *The Crisis* in my argument.

- Smith, Robert C., "DuBois, W.E.B." *Encyclopedia of African-American politics, Second Edition*.

This source gave lengthy background on Du Bois and his work. In this source I extracted the quote "We face a condition, not a theory". This quote from Du Bois

helped me further argue Du Bois's urgency to advance the African American culture.

- Tischauser V., Leslie. *Jim Crow Laws*. (California: Greenwood Publishing, 2012).

This book gave a lot of information regarding Jim Crow Laws in America. I used this information for historical context to illustrate the types of struggles the readers of *The Crisis* were facing.

- Washington, Margaret, "*Margaret Washington: Obstacles faced by African Americans*" Public Broadcasting Service. ACS. October 29, 2016.

This source talked heavily about the struggles and disenfranchisement of African Americans. This source helped me further illustrate the struggles and adversities of African Americans during these times.

- West, Sandra L. "*The Crisis*." *Encyclopedia of the Harlem Renaissance*. Facts On File, 2003. Accessed November 13, 2016. [http://online.infobase.com/Article/Details/160566?q=dubois crisis](http://online.infobase.com/Article/Details/160566?q=dubois%20crisis).

This source provided a plethora of information regarding *This Crisis* and statistics about its average readers and most sold subscriptions. This information was important to my research because it helped me show how massive *The Crisis* became and how it sold more than any other African American of its kind.



Still Life (2016) by Seyma Dereli

Silence and Its Discontents: The Public Arm of Ginny Baker

Robert Georgi

A middle-aged African-American man wearing a baseball mitt urges his young son, to throw him the ball. As often the case with stubborn little boys, Willie jr. wanted no part of this particular activity and runs off. Disappointed, the father begins to chastise his son, who by then had quickly retreated to the porch, crying out for his mother. She quickly comes to his defense: "Bill, he doesn't want to play." "I'm trying to raise a ballplayer here, Janet"

Former Major League hopeful William Baker's exasperation suggests this isn't the first-time young Willie has left him with his hand in the glove. As the screen door slams behind Janet and her son, a little girl, no more than 3-years-old, picks up the ball her brother had so hastily discarded, eliciting a tired smile from her daddy: "That's right, little girl. That's a ball" he said, as he resumed his crouch in the middle of the yard, a few feet away from where she stood. "Throw it to Papa. Throw it, just like

this” (imitates throwing motion). Ever the obedient little girl, three-year-old Ginny Baker cocks her arm back and lets it fly. After watching the ball sail over his head and ricochet off the fence with an audible *thud*, a dumbfounded William Baker looked back at his grinning toddler in the pink sundress and shook his head. “I’ll be damned” he whispered. Mr. Baker had found his ballplayer.

“Pitch” tells the story of Ginny Baker, an inspiring—albeit fictional—account of the first female to ever play Major League Baseball. While moving, the series does more than inspire, it provides deeper insight into the structure of our society. For instance, there have been a few successful stories about adolescent boys making the Major Leagues¹³¹ but until now, little attention had been given to the idea of a female professional baseball player. The fact that film and TV producers haven’t looked—or worse yet, failed to find—a target audience receptive to the idea of a female ballplayer until now is a little

¹³¹ “Rookie of the Year (1993),” “Little Big League (1994)”

unnerving. Admittedly, however, it is difficult to imagine this glass ceiling breaking anytime soon. Women, even at peak physical condition, could never compete with equally-fit men. They throw, run, and catch—*like a girl*. It's not sexist, it's just a fact. And a fact is a fact is a fact; until it isn't.

Anne Carson, author and scholar of the classics, offers her own interpretation of the "facts." In "The Gender of Sound," Carson posits that the distinction between feminine and masculine is constructed by the "patriarchal culture...that divides humanity into two species" (Carson, 130). The sex role demarcation was gerrymandered to idealize male tendencies and pre-ordain inequality. If a woman is feminine, she is inferior because she's not masculine. If she is masculine, it is unacceptable because she is a woman. To borrow her words, Carson's work "does give us a strong image of how ancient culture went about constructing the 'otherness' of the female" (129). This division had a major impact on the development of modern society, both

keeping women marginalized and reminding her children that it was ‘supposed’ to be that way. Gloria Steinem, in her polemic *If Men Could Menstruate* best summarized the fundamentals of this dynamic. “In short, the characteristics of the powerful, whatever they may be, are thought to be better than the characteristics of the powerless” (Steinem, 1978)

Maintaining this power are agents among the academic community; the literati and the conservative canon-cockers, charged with keeping the “unspeakable things” at bay (Carson, 133). Barnard Professor Margaret Vandenburg calls this creative control *Oeditorial Repression*, a concept rooted in the notorious feminist Sigmund Freud’s psychosexual stages of development. Specifically, his use of the Sophoclean tragedy to trademark an idea he had been kicking around ever since he met a young German hippophobe: The logical premise of fearing castration results from the unconscious desire of a little boy to kill his father and “marry” his mother. Vandenburg used aspects of his theory to better

understand the social institutions and individuals (*Oeditors*) she identified as agents of:

...the mechanism whereby female subjectivity and voice are muted, even silenced in Modernism...When a woman fails to 'acknowledge the fact of her own castration' on her own, *Oeditors* intervene to enforce what should have been an internal process, the repression of inappropriate desires. The result is the reinstatement of Oedipal authority, complete and intact" (475-476).

Ladies, what they're trying to tell you is that ya'll ain't got the required 'equipment' to compete with the boys and any continued attempt to subvert this *fact* will only hurt the team. Women will never play Major League Baseball, honey; they just weren't built for it. Humoring young ladies' "inappropriate desires," even fictionally, may give the impression that men and women aren't so different after all; and what kind of train-wreck-society

would that produce? Fearing a deadly outbreak of tinnitus, Vandenburg's *Oeditors* were hard at work plugging any dissonant "leaks" left by progressive writers that might raise unwanted questions. Any deviation from the norm was subject to *deleteur*, a concerted effort meant to ensure the perpetuation of the cycle of domination.

These measures of control deployed by Steinem's "powerful" in their attempts to control the "powerless" are considerably more complex than the types of jockeying seen on the geo-political landscape. Political opponents can be coerced to fall-in-line with violent threats, but because women shoulder (at least) half of the species' reproductive responsibilities, these measures are largely ineffective. One does not take to the guillotine to cure a headache. The female's sexual reproductive role, rather than being taken as evidence that women were as capable as men, was perceived to be a liability which required the steady male hand. Surely, if a woman uses her mouth to "blurt out a direct translation of what should be formulated indirectly," it's chilling to think about what

she will use her vagina for. Repression of sexuality was not only of equal importance as the repression of sound, it sometimes became difficult to delineate which female “mouth” was the object of culturally-emplaced feminine control measures (Carson, 124-130). Culture and Science, two-sides of two very distinct coins, joined forces to efface the feminine voice by drawing from the same polluted source of ancient preconceptions.

Biologically, the only difference between males and females stem from their separate reproductive spheres of responsibility. This is the only “categorical sex difference...” writes Joan Huber, in *On the Origins of Gender Inequality*. “the others are statistical” (Huber, 120). What Huber means to express is that the sexual reproductive system is the only biological *fact* that one can attribute to either of their sexes. Statistical differences may lead one to assume that physical gender differences are rooted in *fact*, but they are merely calculations of the population at large and therefore only identify physical *tendencies* of men and women. If it has a penis, its male. If

it has a vagina, its female. There is no other way to scientifically differentiate between the two. A fact is like a rose, easily susceptible to the toxic conditions of the environment.

If the goal was to keep their voice out of the public sphere and their vagina from becoming “public property,” then Ginny’s rise to the epitome of professional athletics should be a sign that times-are-a-changing. Mr. Baker embodies the patriarchal figure in many ways, but his goal was to get Ginny *into* the public sphere: “A girl will never be able to throw hard enough to compete with the boys,” he told his daughter, “that’s why we need a secret weapon. You’re gonna *master* it little girl and *ride it* straight to the majors...It’s called a *screwball*. (Pilot). Yes, Ginny Baker reached the pinnacle of professional sports by *mastering* the *screwball*. Any potential physical limitations were mitigated by her sexually implicit “secret weapon.” This interlude is disturbing in several ways, but when placed into the historical context of patriarchal suppression, it also seems empowering.

Some may assume the imposition of a secret pitch, the name of which is used in the vernacular to represent the act of sex, was just another way to maintain *Oeditorial* authority. They might cite the thick sexual connotation in her father's choice of words to support that assumption; that Ginny's story is just another example of the sexual objectification of women. I'm sure that even a few would put additional blame on Freud and his hysterical case studies, but if the goal is to suppress both "mouths", as Carson claims, then wouldn't dialogue oozing with sexual innuendo fail to reach the public? Furthermore, the habitual use of baseball references in American culture to symbolize levels of sexual relations doesn't seem very conducive for quiet exercises of self-control. Finally, if "Pitch" has been filtered through the patriarchal lens of female repression, then doesn't it seem more likely that the show would be called "Catch"?

Ginny's story represents the usurping of patriarchal control. She has not only entered the public sphere, she's in the center of it. Her action of throwing the pitch comes

first, before the physically imposing men can even attempt to advance to first base, giving her complete control of the game. The pitching mound is raised, putting her on a slightly higher plane than her male peers. She is a global sensation and is met with adoring crowds. The team she pitches for is mediocre and her body of work as a pitcher leaves much to be desired, but on days she is scheduled to pitch, the game is always sold out. She's a sensation, not in spite of being a woman, but because of it. Naturally, there was resistance to the feminine form in the hyper-masculine locker room. The Manager of the team was castrated by the media for making a comment on the physical attributes of his new star pitcher and it almost cost him his job. In "Pitch" it is the men who can't control what "leaks" from their mouth in the public sphere (Carson).

As previously noted, Sex and Gender are often mistaken as the same thing and in American culture, tend to be used interchangeably. This distinction is necessary because reproductive organs have nothing to do with

identity. "Advancing a new understanding of gender," West and Zimmerman, note in "Doing Gender," requires insight into the actions of the individuals, rather than focusing on inherent physical differences (West and Zimmerman). This is in line with Judith Butler's theory of performativity, she writes: "Gender is the repeated stylization of the body, a set of repeated acts within a highly rigid regulatory frame that congeal over time to produce the appearance of substance, of a natural sort of being (Butler)." If Butler, West, and Zimmerman's conception of gender being a performance is to be believed, it stands to reason that over time, certain expectations of gender roles would arise, constricting both feminine and masculine identities. It turns out, the patriarchal order so maligned with being the source of feminine inferiority, had similar adverse effects with its insistence on masculine superiority. These "Manhood Acts" according to sociologists Shrock and Schwalbe, were the only way men are able to prove their masculinity, which, at least traditionally, was "aimed at creating

privilege, eliciting deference, and resisting exploitation” (Schrock and Schwalbe, 288). Both sexes were required to “do gender properly” in order to achieve certain statuses (289). Contemporary research suggests it may not have been the “otherness” of the female that was unsettling, but rather anything that deviates from the norm.

“Pitch” seems to embrace the otherness. It brings to the fore questions about who we are as men, women, and everything in between. Before she takes the mound for the first time, during warm-ups, the star of the team who would also be “catching” her screwball, gives her the baseball equivalent of a compliment; by slapping her ass. Ginny’s reaction most likely stemmed from years of constantly having to remind her teammates that kind of behavior wasn’t going to fly. “Want to put on a show for your friends?” she said, “Find another scene partner, I’m here to pitch.” But as she began to walk away, he grabbed her arm and reminded her of her place:

Hey! I slap asses. It's my thing. I slap Zimmerman's pimply ass, I slap Roger's hairy ass, and as long as you're on this team, I will be slapping your perfect, pear-shaped ass. I am an ass-slapper, rookie. I'm also the captain of this team. So from here on out, every time I slap your ass, you just say, "Thank you, sir."

Satisfied that his "performance" of masculinity had nothing to do with her being female, the conversation turned to baseball, where the rules are clearly established.

"Pitch" doesn't redefine gender roles, it undefines them.

Works Cited

- Butler, J. (1990). *Gender Trouble. Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* Routledge, UK.
- Carson, A. (1995) "The Gender of Sound" *Glass, Irony, and God*. New Directions FOX Studios (2016) Pitch: The Untold Story of Ginny Baker "Pilot"
- Shrock, D. & Schwalbe, M. (2009) "Men, Masculinity, and Manhood Acts" *Annual Review of Sociology* (277-295)
- Steinem, G. (1978) "If Men Could Menstruate" *Ms. Magazine* Oct. 1978.
- Vandenburg, M. (2005) "Oeditorial Repression: The Case Histories of Hemingway and the Fitzgeralds." *Prospects: An Annual of Cultural American Studies*. Vol. 30 471-486
- West, C and Zimmerman, D. (1987) "Doing Gender" *Gender and Society*, Vol. 1, No. 2. pp.125-151



Turtle (2016) by Puhong Li

A bibliographical essay on the Nuclear Bombings in Hiroshima and Nagasaki

Tyler Kerekgyarto

In modern history, that is being approximately the last 120 years, very few periods have as much controversy and discussion as the years surrounding World War II. Between events including the Holocaust, Soviet Gulags, and the nuclear bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki, much of the war is hotly contested by historians. The nuclear bombings in Japan are the most contested of the wartime events. Hiroshima and Nagasaki are still argued about today, and the arguments surrounding them divide generally into two groups of thought, those against the bombing and those in support of the bombings. Some of those who have written in support of the bombings include Ward Wilson in his 2007 article, "The Winning Weapon?: Rethinking Nuclear Weapons in Light of Hiroshima," and Kai Bird in his 1996 book, *Hiroshima's Shadow: Writings on the Denial of History and the Smithsonian Controversy*. The group of historians who generally argue

against the bombs in much larger than those in support, and it includes Alice Kimball Smith and her 1965 writing "After Hiroshima," Rinjiro Sodei and his 1995 article "Hiroshima/Nagasaki as History and Politics," and Kenzaburo Oe and his 1981 article "Japan's Search for Identity in the Nuclear Age." I believe that the bombings were not justified, and that a combination of more effective conventional bombing runs combined with the Soviet entrance into the war was enough for the Japanese to surrender without a much-feared US invasion of Japan.

On August 6th, 1945, the Japanese city of Hiroshima flashed bright with the fission of the uranium-based bomb codenamed Little Boy dropped from B-29 Superfortress the Enola Gay. Three days later, the skies over Nagasaki would be lit up the same from the explosion of the plutonium-based Fat Man dropped from B-29 Bockscar.¹³² The combined bombings, plus the resulting firestorms, destroyed both cities nearly completely. The explosions,

¹³² Atomic Heritage Foundation. "Little Boy and Fat Man." Atomicheritage.org. (Accessed December 4, 2016).

the fires, and the subsequent illnesses killed, instantly and over time, somewhere between 246,000 and 317,000 people.¹³³ The one question that has been in the minds of anyone who has ever known or learned of these bombings has been the same: Were these bombings justified or necessary? The simple and unfortunate answer is no. The reasoning for such a statement is evident in many aspects of the end of the war in the Pacific Theater.

To start off with, there is the simple argument of the overall effectiveness of the bombs. The most commonly-accepted death toll in Hiroshima alone is anywhere between 90,000 and 166,000, not including residual deaths from the fire or illness which brings the total to about 237,000.¹³⁴ When Tokyo was firebombed in 1945, the death toll was nearly the same as the one-day death toll of Hiroshima. In Tokyo, "The Tokyo Fire Department estimated 97,000 killed and 125,000 wounded.

¹³³ Atomic Heritage Foundation. "The Atomic Bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki-1945." [Atomicheritage.org](http://atomicheritage.org). (Accessed December 4, 2016).

¹³⁴ *Ibid.*

The Tokyo Police offered a figure of 124,711 killed and wounded and 286,358 building and homes destroyed.”¹³⁵ Just looking at the figures presented for Hiroshima and Tokyo, there is not a great deal of difference. The only difference may be that the nuclear bomb was much more efficient, and only needed a few planes instead of an entire fleet. However, there is another side of the story to look at when it comes to the firebombing. According to Mark Selden, who wrote the article the above quote is from, goes on to take a more investigative approach to discussing these numbers. Selden brings up the idea that either side, that being the United States and Japan, had reasons and motive to lessen the numbers presented for political reasons. He also states that the totals, based on environmental factors as well as the number and strength

¹³⁵ Mark Selden. “A Forgotten Holocaust: US Bombing Strategy, the Destruction of Japanese Cities & the American Way of War from World War II to Iraq,” *The Asia Pacific Journal: Japan Focus* 5:5 (May 2007): 9. The article was sourced from the journal’s website, and archived there in PDF format, without the original page numbers intact. Because the original publication was seemingly unable to be found, all page numbers are in reference to their place in the PDF document, not the original publication.

of the bombs, would have made a much bigger total than was reported by either side involved.¹³⁶ From the information provided and analyzed by Selden shows that the firebombing was nearly as effective as the nuclear bombings.

The best way to discuss the differences in efficiency would be to look at the numbers from one of the nuclear sites and one of the conventional bombing runs. The Boeing B-29 Superfortress, used in the Pacific Theater of World War II, was capable of delivering about 10 tons of traditional TNT bombs during a run.¹³⁷ The Atomic Heritage Foundation, in describing the nuclear bombs, writes that Little Boy was the equivalent of 15,000 tons of TNT and Fat Man was the equivalent of 21,000 tons.¹³⁸ Using those numbers, the amount of B-29's that would have needed to be used in a traditional bombing run to give the same power would have been 1500 and 2100,

¹³⁶ Selden.

¹³⁷ Jack Doherty. "Atomic Bomb Fury Hits Japan," *The Daily News*. August 7, 1945.

¹³⁸ "Little Boy and Fat Man."

respectively. However, that is not strictly true, as many of the B-29s were modified to allow them to carry more bombs. The Tokyo raid used 334 B-29s, but managed to kill around the same number of people, and destroy hundreds of thousands of buildings.¹³⁹ The disparity in the estimated number that it would take to provide the same damage and the number used is massive, just over one-fifth of the amount in Hiroshima's case. This is because, according to Selden, each of the planes that bombed Tokyo "M47s, 100-pound oil gel bombs, 182 per aircraft, each capable of starting a major fire, followed by M69s, 6-pound gelled gasoline bombs, 1,520 per aircraft."¹⁴⁰ This means that each aircraft was carrying approximately 13.7 tons of destructive force, making the total tonnage of the bombs dropped on Tokyo at approximately 4575.8 tons. While this number is only about one-third of the destructive power unleashed on Hiroshima, it was extremely close to killing the same

¹³⁹ Selden.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid.

number of people and decimating a large area of the city, as stated earlier in this piece.

This detail brings about an idea which challenges the common notion that the nuclear bombs were immoral. The firebombing of Tokyo, which was one of many in Japan, was almost as effective if not the same. The morality, or lack thereof, is best told by those who were there and saw the destruction first hand. John Hersey wrote about just this in his article and later book, *Hiroshima*. A journalist during the Second World War, Hersey both saw the bombings and interviewed those that lived there and survived the explosions. In order to find out how the bomb had affected people in the long run, Hersey interviewed those still living 40 years later. One story that stuck out was that of Father Wilhelm Kleinsorge, a catholic priest who was about a mile away from ground zero in Hiroshima. Managing to survive with only minor injuries, he tells his story over the 3 decades since World War II. Father Kleinsorge's fellow priests detail his life of devotion to the Catholic Church

and the citizens of Hiroshima. They are adamant to say that some ailments possibly caused by radiation had not slowed him down nor prevented him from living his life. He fell into a coma at the hospital in 1977 and soon after died, but doctors were unsure of the cause of the coma or his death.¹⁴¹ The other stories go on to detail the lives of others who survived with, at most, ailments which were all but fixed through surgery. This includes the story of Toshiko Sasaki, who made the most of her life after living through the bombing of Hiroshima.¹⁴² None of the people reported having major problems living their life after the bombings.¹⁴³ Overall, in the cases that Hersey discusses, the nuclear bombs were no more injuring than regular firebombs.

¹⁴¹ John Hersey. *Hiroshima*. (Random House, New York, NY.: 1989).

¹⁴² *Ibid.* Toshiko Sasaki has a somewhat similar story to that of Father Kleinsorge. She had to have three surgeries on her leg after the bombing in order to correct misalignment. She was able to walk, albeit with some pain, but like Father Kleinsorge it did not stop her from living her life. She did show other symptoms that could have been attributed to radiation, but her doctors were inconclusive about this.

¹⁴³ Hersey.

However some others have a different view of the nuclear attacks. Rinjiro Sodei writes in his article, "Hiroshima/Nagasaki as History and Politics," that the nuclear bombings were the beginning of the suffering of people who are entitled Hibakusha, or "those who were exposed to the bombs."¹⁴⁴ Sodei talks about the life these people have lived since the bombings. He writes that they were afraid of a variety of things including potential radiation disease and passing on effects to their children.¹⁴⁵ It is worthy of mention though that the people whose lives Hersey discussed did not talk about any major suffering in any way, other than a few relatively minor injuries. The way Sodei discusses the survivors of the bombings is very much in support of the argument of morality, being very adamant that those that survived lived a terrible life. However, for this argument, Sodei does not back it up with examples from real people's lives like Hersey does. In many ways, this makes it hard to

¹⁴⁴ Rinjiro Sodei. "Hiroshima/Nagasaki as History and Politics," *The Journal of American History* 82:3 (1995): 1120.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid.

accept Sodei's argument as completely true. While yes, there are definitely cases of people whose lives were severely affected by one of the bombs, the fact that Sodei seemingly states that all 350,000 survivors live a horrible life seems quite incredulous based on Hersey's journalism.¹⁴⁶

While Sodei's argument is at odds in ways with Hersey's argument, another perspective to discuss in the topic of morality is the scientists who worked on the project. Alice Kimball Smith brings in their points of view in her article entitled "After Hiroshima" from 1965. Smith discusses the remorse and reaction from American Scientists who developed the atomic power used in the bombs. While many approved of the use, several were worried about the moral, political, and military implications the use of nuclear power on citizens had on the world. Many agreed that this new power needed to be

¹⁴⁶ Atomic Archive. "Long Term Effects on Humans." Atomicarchive.com. (Accessed December 5, 2016). This website lists a few of the effects of the bombs on people who survived the explosions. Ailments such as cataracts, malignant tumors, and keloids affected some survivors, according to the Japanese government.

strictly regulated, but did not want to wait until the United Nations had the power to do so. He states that since this would not happen before a potential nuclear arms race, it was a problem of immediate urgency.¹⁴⁷ The scientists that saw the use immoral and dangerous spoke out for its regulation before the bombs dropped as well, as also written by Smith. During the process of the research, Farrington Daniels, a scientist in charge of Met Labs, who were doing work on the research, plead at a meeting for the use of fissionable materials to be displayed to the world in some way other than in the field of war.¹⁴⁸ The argument of morality definitely has very strong proponents, but it does not detract from the fact that it is not moral to bomb civilians in any way, traditionally or nuclearly.

The moral side of the argument is not the focal point of this study, however, although it does involve much of the same material. What matters is not why the

¹⁴⁷ Alice Kimball Smith. *A Peril and a Hope: The Scientists' Movement in America: 1945-47*. (The University of Chicago Press: Chicago, IL, 1965).

¹⁴⁸ Ibid.

bombs were used, but rather if they needed to be used at all. There is a very strong argument for them not being used, which is the Soviet entrance into World War II, which happened on August 8th, 1945.¹⁴⁹ This was only two days after Hiroshima was bombed, and Joseph Stalin, no longer bogged down in Europe, decided to make his offensive against the Japanese Empire. The Soviets invaded Manchuria with over 1.5 million men against the just over 1 million men of Japan and her allies and pushed them southward towards Korea.¹⁵⁰ The Japanese had been hopeful that the Soviets would be able to intervene in the war and be a moderator at the peace conference once the war was over.¹⁵¹ This was one of their ways to end the war without the total destruction of their nation. Their other way to end the war quickly would be another blow

¹⁴⁹ History Channel. "1945: Soviets Declare War on Japan; Invade Manchuria." History.com. (Accessed November 23, 2016).

¹⁵⁰ David M. Glantz and Jonathan M. House. *When Titans Clashed: How the Red Army Stopped Hitler*. (University Press of Kansas: Lawrence, KS, 1995).

¹⁵¹ Ward Wilson. "The Winning Weapon?: Rethinking Nuclear Weapons in Light of Hiroshima," *International Security* 31:4 (2007): 162-179.

to the United States, one that was even larger than Pearl Harbor, and which would hopefully make them more lenient in the peace talks.¹⁵² The Soviet entrance accompanied a reaction from the Supreme War Direction Council of Japan that was not the desired effect of the bombing of Hiroshima, which was a full and unconditional surrender. In fact, many of the members of the council made demands that only once satisfied, they would consider capitulating. Some of these demands included the status of Emperor Hirohito after the war, and Japan's general post-war position.¹⁵³ When the first bomb dropped, Hirohito wanted the council to accept unconditional surrender, deciding that the world had gone too far, and he did not want to see the complete and total destruction of Japan for the sake of honor.¹⁵⁴ However, many on the council, as mentioned above, did not agree with him. Once the Soviets invaded, Hirohito pleaded for some of the members to change their opinion,

¹⁵² Wilson.

¹⁵³ History Channel.

¹⁵⁴ Glantz.

and some of them who were not sure started to sway towards surrender.¹⁵⁵

Overall, the use of the nuclear bombs was not necessary in the Second World War. The effectiveness of the bombs was not a great deal different than the traditional strategic fire bombing raids already carried out. The nuclear bombs' usage only made the bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki more controversial than the rest of the bombing raids in Japan. As Ward Wilson wrote in his article "The Winning Weapon?," "The Hiroshima bombing was simply an extension of an already fierce bombing campaign."¹⁵⁶ The Japanese just saw it as another way the Americans were trying to bomb them into submission. This lack of major reaction, along with the relative ineffectiveness of the bombs to properly overpower regular bombing raids renders their use obsolete. However, the bombs truly become obsolete when the Soviet entrance to the war is considered.

¹⁵⁵ History Channel.

¹⁵⁶ Wilson, 165.

Believing the Soviets would not be a problem until 1946, the Japanese severely underestimated Stalin's ambition to expand eastward, therefore placing too much trust in the U.S.S.R.'s future ability, or willingness, to be a moderator at peace talks to ensure Japan's survival in the post war world. Lastly, also due to this overconfidence in the Soviets, Japan believed they would be able to pull off a massive attack on the United States. However, once the Soviets got involved, the Japanese would not be able to have sustained a two-front war. Therefore, it is because of the Soviet involvement in the war, and the fact that all of Japan's exit strategies depended on the Soviets staying neutral, not the nuclear bombings, that made the Japanese surrender. The bombs may have accelerated the process, but it would have definitely happened anyway, especially if the Soviets made it to the southern tip of Korea.

The Second World War is the era of many atrocities and war crimes that it is one of the defining themes of the war. Between the Soviet Gulags, Nazi concentration camps, the Nanking Massacre by the Japanese, and the Japanese

internment camps in America, the war was a rather immoral period in modern history. The nuclear bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki added to these atrocities, not because of the effect of the bombs on the people they injured and killed, but because their use was utterly unnecessary, and in no way coerced Japan to surrender. If the bombs were as terrible as they are generally perceived to be, the Japanese would have done more to stop further destruction of their country. However, to them, it was just another bomb, and it wasn't until the Soviets invaded Manchuria that the Japanese considered surrendering. Overall, one can understand the factors that made the nuclear bombs appealing to the American government. Repayment for Pearl Harbor, intimidation factor, or whatever one could come up with. However, in hindsight, with new research that debunks common theories about the true destruction of the bombs, it is truly possible to see that the bombs were not what made the Japanese surrender, and without using them, the Japanese would probably still have Hiroshima and Nagasaki, and the

United States would have come out of the war much better off image and controversy wise, having not used cruel, and unnecessary, bombs.

Bibliography

- Atomic Heritage Foundation. "Little Boy and Fat Man." Atomicheritage.org. (Accessed December 4, 2016).
- Atomic Heritage Foundation. "The Atomic Bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki-1945." Atomicheritage.org. (Accessed December 4, 2016).
- Bird, Kai. *Hiroshima's Shadow: Writings on the Denial of History and the Smithsonian Controversy*. (Pamphleteer's Press, Stony Creek, CT.: 1996).
- Doherty, Jack. "Atomic Bomb Fury Hits Japan," *The Daily News*. August 7, 1945.
- Hersey, John. *Hiroshima*. (Random House, New York, NY.: 1989).
- Selden, Mark. "A Forgotten Holocaust: US Bombing Strategy, the Destruction of Japanese Cities & the American Way of War from World War II to Iraq," *The Asia Pacific Journal: Japan Focus* 5:5 (May 2007): 1-29.

- Smith, Alice Kimball. "After Hiroshima," (1965) Leo Szilard Papers. MSS 32. Special Collections & Archives, UC San Diego Library
- Sodei, Rinjiro. "Hiroshima/Nagasaki as History and Politics," *The Journal of American History* 82:3 (1995): 1118-1123.
- Wilson, Ward. "The Winning Weapon?: Rethinking Nuclear Weapons in Light of Hiroshima," *International Security* 31:4 (2007): 162-179



Still Life (2017) by Seyma Dereli



**Middlesex County College
2600 Woodbridge Ave,
Edison, New Jersey. 08818**